

# D2.1. Desired Status Report



Project Number: 101056515

Agreement Number: 101056515 — TUTOR — ERASMUS-EDU-2021-PEX-TEACH-ACA



Work Package:	Work Package 2: Assessment of the desired state in terms of inclusiveness in the school community
Туре:	R-Report
Dissemination level:	PU-Public
Version:	V1.5 final
Delivery date:	3 <sup>rd</sup> of August 2023
Keywords:	Inclusive education, intersectionality, initial teacher education, teaching practices, continuous professional development, LGBTQI+, migrants, ethnic, socio-economically disadvantaged students
Abstract:	In this report we sum up the findings of previous tasks and summarize all the data that we have received from the desk research and open consultation process with teachers and stakeholders regarding the desired state in terms of inclusiveness.
Authors:	Margaret Nugent, Maynooth University Bernie Grummell, Maynooth University
Contact Persons:	Margaret Nugent, <u>Margaret.Nugent@mu.ie</u> Bernie Grummell, Maynooth University, <u>Bernie.Grummell@mu.ie</u>





# 1 Table of Contents

Introduc	tion	6
Section 1	I. Transnational Literature Review	6
1. Incl	usive education definition	6
Policy	on inclusive education	7
1.1.	EU wide	7
1.2.	Greece	8
1.3.	Austria	9
1.4.	Turkey	10
1.5.	Ireland	12
2. LGB	TQI+ students	
2.1	EU Wide	
2.2	Greece	15
2.3	Austria	
2.4	Turkey	
2.5	Ireland	
3. Mig	rant, Refugee and Asylum-Seeking Students	19
3.1.	EU Wide	19
3.2.	Greece	20
3.3.	Austria	22
3.4.	Turkey	
3.5.	Ireland	23
4. Soci	io-economic disadvantaged students	
4.1.	EU Wide	
4.2.	Greece	25
4.3.	Austria	
4.4.	Turkey	
4.5.	Ireland	
5. Initi	al Teacher Education and Continuous Professional Development	
5.1.	EU Wide	
5.2.	Greece	
5.3.	Austria	
5.4.	Turkey	
5.5.	Ireland	
	themes emerging in the Literature Review	
6.1.	Legislation and Policy Instruments	



Co-funded by

the European Union

Views and opinions expressed are however those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or EACEA. Neither the European Union nor the granting authority can be held responsible for them.



6.2.	Definitions of Inclusive Education	41
6.3.	Teachers' Feelings	41
6.4.	Teachers' Attitudes and Expectations	41
6.5.	Initial Teacher Education (ITE) & Continuous Professional Development (CPD)	41
6.6.	Discrimination	42
6.7.	EU Wide Literature Review	42
7. Sum	ımary	42
Section 2	. Field Research on the Desired Status of Inclusive Education	43
Part 1. Te	eachers' Focus Group	43
Ove	rview of Focus Groups with Teachers	43
1. Dive	ersity-Desired Status	43
1.1.	Greece	43
1.2.	Austria	44
1.3.	Turkey	45
1.4.	Ireland	46
1.5.	Summary	47
2. Initia	al Teacher Education (ITE) and Continuous Professional Development (CPD)	47
2.1.	Greece	47
2.2.	Austria	48
2.3.	Turkey	48
2.4.	Ireland	49
2.5.	Summary	50
3. Key	Themes - LGBTQI+, Migrant, Ethnic, Socio-Economic Disadvantaged Students	50
3.1.	Greece	50
3.2.	Austria	51
3.3.	Turkey	51
3.4.	Ireland	53
3.5.	Summary	54
Part 2. St	akeholders' Focus Group or Interviews	55
Ove	rview: Inclusive Education, Intersectionality	55
1. Stak	eholders' Key Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations	55
1.1.	Greece	55
1.2.	Austria	56
1.3.	Turkey	57
1.4.	Ireland	58
2. Stak	eholders' Conclusions and Recommendations: Inclusive Education	59



Co-funded by the European Union for them.

Views and opinions expressed are however those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or EACEA. Neither the European Union nor the granting authority can be held responsible



2.1.	Greece
2.2.	Austria
2.3.	Turkey
2.4.	Ireland61
	ning Programs - Initial Teacher Education (ITE) & Continuous Professional nent
3.1.	Greece
3.2.	Austria
3.3.	Turkey
3.4.	Ireland
3.5.	Conclusions
4. Refe	erences
4.1.	EU Wide 67
4.2.	Austria
4.3.	Ireland73
4.4.	Turkey
4.5.	Greece
Annex	1 - QAB Evaluation Grid of Desired Status Report82





# Introduction

This desired status report is structured in 2 sections. Section 1 is a Transnational Literature Review comprising a synopsis of the literature that was reviewed in each of the TUTOR partner countries, Greece, Austria, Turkey and Ireland and at EU wide level. The literature provides an insight into both the national and EU policies, frameworks and research in relation to inclusive education. It reviews and conceptualizes intersectionality, explores diversity in education in the context of, Initial Teacher Education (ITE) and Continuous Professional Development (CPD). The literature review outlines contemporary research on the desired status in relation to inclusive education focusing on LGBTQI+, migrant, ethnic minorities, e.g. Traveller and Roma and socio-economic disadvantaged students.

Section 2 reports on the desired status of inclusive education according to the findings of the open consultation process conducted by TUTOR partners in Greece, Austria, Turkey and Ireland during December 2022 and January 2023 with teachers in second level, Vocational Education and Training (VET) and Further Education and Training (FET) as well as with stakeholders in education in the partner countries. The field research open consultation process reflected upon the key themes outlined above, such as inclusive education, intersectionality, diversity in education, inclusive education in relation to the specific student cohorts, Initial Teacher Education. The open consultation process engaged 64 participants using qualitative methodology, focus group meetings with teachers and focus group meetings and interviews with stakeholders in education. Section 2 provides a synopsis of the discussions across the TUTOR partner counttries, and is organized to reflect the key themes outlined above, including conclusions and recommendations from the research participants in each country.

Whilst this overall report aims to extrapolate the desired status, from the actual status, the TUTOR partners have encountered conceptual challenges in separating the findings into the desired status and the existing status. At times the actual status is reported on and contained within this report, as natural overlap occurs, especially in the open consultation process.

# Section 1. Transnational Literature Review

The transnational literature review provides an amalgamation of the national literature reviews that were undertaken in each partner country, Greece, Austria, Turkey and Ireland, as well as at EU wide level. It presents a synopsis of the contemporary literature and research in each jurisdiction pertaining to inclusive education at second level, Vocational Education and Training (VET) and in the case of Ireland, includes Further Education and Training (FET). Each of the partners national literature review sets the context for the legislative basis and policy directives, the desired status in relation to inclusive education, diversity and intersectionality, inclusion of LGBTQI+, migrant, ethnic minority and socio-economically disadvantaged students.

# 1. Inclusive education definition

Inclusive education is experienced and understood across the partner countries as education that aims to include all students, with a particular focus on disability and special needs. The findings in the transnational literature review suggests that limited attention is given to the





impact of intersectionality, or of broadening the definition of inclusive education in teachers' practice. Intersectionality is a concept that describes how different social identities, such as race, gender, class, and ability, intersect and interact with each other, creating unique experiences of oppression and privilege. The literature describes how intersectionality is the study of how various forms of oppression, discrimination, domination, and other social processes intersect and influence each other. For instance, students in schools can belong to more than one marginalized group. An intersectional education lens takes various social, historical, and political processes into consideration to best understand how to support the wide range of experiences of diverse students. Intersectionality requires that policy makers, school policies and teachers avoid the short-sighted perception of individuals as possessing only one static identity marker and takes the socio-historical gravity of a society into account (Crenshaw, 1989). Various factors (i.e., power relations or categories) shape an education system and an individual's experience within it, and processes of discrimination, exclusion, and marginalization are ubiquitous. It recognizes that inclusive education is not implemented in a vacuum. The societies in which inclusion is carried out are historically stratified, in part as the result of the influence of interlocking systems of power. Hence, an intersectional lens in inclusive education is essential to identify the interaction of multiple factors that lead to discriminatory processes in schools' access and participation towards different student groups. Educational outcomes and opportunities for students are influenced by the contextual interplay of different identity markers and the intersection with historically perpetuated inequalities within a stratified society.

## Policy on inclusive education

#### 1.1. EU wide

## **Legislation and Policy instruments**

International, European, and national strategy, legislation and policy documents are in place to guide inclusive education. However, the findings of the TUTOR literature review suggest that the definition of inclusive education in policy documents is difficult to interpret or is limited in its expression and needs to become clearer and more expansive. TUTORs review of the literature suggests that the practice and implementation of frameworks for inclusive education is fragmented and varies widely amongst teachers, schools and across partner countries. The Tutor partners analysis of the literature posits that notwithstanding the existence of instruments to enhance inclusive education, there are incidences of school segregation of marginalized students, and or exclusionary practices across the education systems under review.

#### Policy Instruments at International, and National Level

Article 24 of the UN Conventions provides the right to inclusive education. In December 2017, the European Council, European Parliament, and the Commission endorsed the adoption of the European Pillar of social rights. The first principle of the European Pillar of social rights underlines that: "Everyone has the right to quality and inclusive education, training and lifelong learning in order to maintain and acquire skills that enable them to participate fully in society and manage successfully transitions in the labor market."

- The Paris Declaration of March 2015 further reinforced the idea of inclusive education to combat racism and discrimination.
- The Gothenburg Social Summit 2017, the European Commission set out its vision for a European Education Area.





- One of the objectives of the European Education Area should be to support EU Member States in improving the inclusive nature of their education and training systems.
- The 2020 Council Recommendation on vocational education and training (VET) for sustainable competitiveness, social fairness and resilience calls on VET programs to be inclusive and accessible for vulnerable groups, such as people with disabilities, lowqualified/ skilled persons, minorities, people with migrant background and people with fewer opportunities because of their geographical location and/or their socialeconomically disadvantaged situation.
- The Commission has also established an ET 2020 Working Group on Promoting Common Values and Inclusive Education, which has produced a concise online compendium of good practices in this field.

Despite the policy frameworks, guidelines and instruments at international and national level, research by the International Gay and Lesbian Youth Organization (IGLYO) shows that LGBTQI+ + students continue to experience discrimination and violence in schools, teachers have reported that they are lacking in confidence to discuss LGBTQI+ inclusion, and in some Member States increased prejudice is emerging.

## 1.2. Greece

#### **Inclusive Education in Greek context**

Researchers, such as Papas -Papoutsi -Drigas, state that inclusive education is now firmly established as the educational policy for students with special educational needs and disabilities, which emerges as the means of creating an inclusive society in which equal opportunities are provided.

In Greece, the definition "inclusive education" officially does not apply and is not in use in mainstream formal education. In this context and under the Greek Constitution's statement that "education aims at the moral, intellectual, professional and physical training of all Greeks, the development of national and religious consciousness and the creation of free and responsible citizens". The first formal definition of inclusive education is regarded as "the educational approach that considers the diversity of learners' needs and aims at overcoming barriers and ensuring equal access to the learning of all students including those with disabilities" (Law 4547/2018, article 2).

Greece is part of the countries signing the UN Convention of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. Adopting the alignment of inclusivity with disability has forged the creation of an inclusive education system fostering the inclusivity of students living with disabilities and special educational needs. Learners living with disabilities and special educational needs are among the most marginalized groups, as they are too often deprived of their right to quality education.

Furthermore, most existing practices promoting diversity are built on research that has been conducted on intercultural education. Considering that the concept has the central idea of interaction between cultures, the practices built around interculturalism promote human rights, equity, and mutual understanding in schools. Its importance is described in "Intercultural learning" as a concept, and even more, as a practice or process, is not isolated. It is linked to our realities, societal changes, politics, economic development, justice, human rights, education, ecology, health and biology, and globalization. Intercultural learning can intersect with all areas in which human beings interact." Based on the above, intercultural





education is a reasonable basis for creating an inclusive educational framework. Then why is interculturalism not enough?

The main problem could be the following: supporters of intercultural education imply the use of constructs that allow generalizing about a given "culture" (a group, nation, or state) without too much concern for social and political aspects of the inner diversity of a culture and its fluidity. This also ignores the possible needs rooted in gender diversity and the special intellectual learning needs of students. These unique characteristics are individual and beyond cultures and often expose students to exclusion.

The universal idea behind inclusive education raises the question: how to include students with diverse intellectual and learning abilities and needs into mainstream education without segregating them or ensuring that they are not exploited to discrimination?

An inclusive education focusing on the intersectional approach in teaching students being part of LGBTQI+ community and having migrant and socioeconomically disadvantaged background is not considered part of the Greek educational system since there is a limited number of actions and policies practically embracing the multiple identities of the students and considering an intersectional approach in education.

The values and norms by which educational staff sometimes operate and teach, as well as the educational suggestions sometimes are not helpful for the decrease and limitation of educational inequalities (Angelides, 2011). To address these difficulties, school leaders/managers should take the initiative and be the first to implement equal opportunities policies to improve the school and make it a success. To make this possible, the principal of each school should follow some democratic inclusive practices (Angelidou, 2011).

The collaborative method is a teaching practice that promotes inclusive education. Another practice that promotes inclusive education is co-teaching. Co-teaching promotes the collaboration of two or more teachers to support and progress all students, improve the school unit and change the school culture. Teachers collaborate and share opinions, knowledge, concerns and jointly shape the teaching process with the sole purpose of empowering all students.

#### **Desired Status**

In this context, it is highly essential to design and develop teachers' training programs fostering the inclusion of students with diverse learning needs and different backgrounds while also considering the intersectional dimension of the education corresponding to the interconnected and multiple identities of the students.

## 1.3. Austria

# Inclusive Education in the Austrian context *Existing Status*

In Austria, there is a great diversity in the understanding of the term inclusion in the field of school education; there is a lack of a clearly defined common understanding of this term. So-called inclusive schools clearly focus on students and young people with disabilities and joint education with their peers in mainstream schools. Thus, also in the education directorates of the federal states, the institutional subject area of inclusion, usually called inclusion, diversity and special needs education, is strongly focused on students with special educational needs. "In the context of the development towards inclusive schools, increased participation of all stakeholders is explicitly desired." (Streese et al., 2017, p. 33) This creates the need for





cooperation and balance between the diverse demands and interest groups, which can be seen, for example, in increased media communication of education policy, the establishment of expert groups, citizens' forums or surveys.

#### **Desired Status**

"The most important characteristic for the success of an inclusive school is a school culture whose features include the recognition and appreciation of difference, the provision of educational opportunities for all pupils, strong collaboration within the staff and the promotion of cooperation between pupils, school staff and parents." (Dyson, 2010, p. 1-11)

There is a political will to mainstream inclusive education from pre-school through school and university education to adult education, both in objectives and in measures, for example in the development of inclusive concepts and "trial schools" in inclusive model regions, but unfortunately the results are moderate. The lack of success of efforts to anchor inclusion as a basic principle in the mainstream of the school system is certainly also due to the rather federal education policy system, which is still fragmented despite reforms.

The amendment of the Higher Education Act (2013) created the basis for a restructuring of teacher training that is revolutionary in German-speaking countries. In it, "inclusive education" is defined and anchored as an indispensable pedagogical foundation for all students.

## 1.4. Turkey

#### Legal basis of Inclusive Education

The Constitution of the Republic of Turkey and many binding international conventions to which Turkey is part of, prohibit discrimination based on gender, language, religion, disability, and race. In both national and international legislation, the right to education is seen as a right that covers everyone. Although the term "inclusive education" has not been fully adopted in the national legislation, an approach that identifies with this principle can be observed when it comes to gender and disability. Inclusive education is seen by the Education for All movement (EFA) under UNESCO as a key strategy for an education that includes all. According to the Basic Law of National Education (METK)<sup>1</sup>, "every Turkish citizen has the right" to attend primary education and equal opportunities are provided for both men and women in education. According to the principle of equality in METK, educational institutions are open to everyone regardless of gender, language, religion, race, or disability.

Inclusive education in Turkey refers to an educational approach that seeks to provide equitable access to education for all students, regardless of their background or abilities. The goal of inclusive education is to ensure that all students have the opportunity to learn, develop and participate in school and society.

In Turkey, inclusive education has gained importance in recent years due to the government's efforts to improve educational opportunities for all students, including those who are marginalized or have disabilities. The Turkish government has enacted laws and regulations to ensure the inclusion of students with disabilities in mainstream schools and has implemented various programs to support the education of disadvantaged groups, such as students from low-income families and those living in rural areas. However, there are still significant challenges that need to be addressed to ensure that all students have access to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> <u>https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/documents/issues/education/training/fourthphase/midterm-proress-report/states/2022-09-05/Turkiye-fourth-phase.pdf</u>



Views and opinions expressed are however those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or EACEA. Neither the European Union nor the granting authority can be held responsible for them.



quality education. Many schools lack the necessary infrastructure and trained personnel to provide inclusive education for students with disabilities, leading to their exclusion from education.

Intersectionality is a concept that describes how different social identities, such as race, gender, class, and ability, intersect and interact with each other, creating unique experiences of oppression and privilege. In Turkey, intersectionality plays an important role in understanding and addressing the barriers to inclusive education faced by different groups of students. For example, girls with disabilities from low-income families living in rural areas may face multiple forms of discrimination and marginalization that prevent them from accessing education. Similarly, refugee and asylum-seeking students with disabilities may face unique challenges in accessing the Turkish education system due to language barriers and lack of resources.

Understanding how different forms of marginalization intersect and interact is important for developing effective policies and programs to promote inclusive education in Turkey. By taking an intersectional approach, it is possible to address the specific needs and challenges faced by different groups of students and to ensure that all students have equal opportunities to learn, develop and participate in society.

Changes and developments around the world have brought new approaches and orientations in the field of education. As a result of this change and development, a holistic perspective regeneration of the training program requirements has emerged in Turkey (Karacaoğlu, 2006). In the primary school curriculum, a "constructivist" approach has been implemented in Turkey since 2005. This program aims to provide students with the skills of questioning, problem solving and decision making based on activity, multiple intelligence theory and a studentcentred approach. Teachers were seen as key people in the implementation of this program because the success of any program depends on the teachers' adoption and implementation of the program (Eğitim Reform Girişimi [ERG], 2005; Gömleksiz, 2007).

The education program which was based on a constructivist approach has been replaced by the program implemented in the 1st, 5th and 9th grade classrooms in the 2017- 2018 academic year. Teachers were consulted during the preparation of the program (ERG, 2017a). The difference of this curriculum from others is that it places the issue of value education in the centre of the program. The program aims to transfer values such as charity, justice, patriotism, friendship, responsibility, honesty, respect and love. In addition, this program "21st Century Skills" aims to provide students with the following competencies and skills: Cultural awareness and expression, communication in mother tongue, social and public competences, communication in foreign languages, taking initiative and entrepreneurship perception, mathematics competence, learning to learn, science and technology competence, digital competence.

Karacaoğlu and Acar (2010) listed the following problems in their research on "Problems faced by teachers in the implementation of renewed programs":

- Not enough time in the planning and implementation of the activities;
- Inadequate preparation of activities for the new program and evaluating performance;
- In-service training activities for transferring the new program to teachers were found to be insufficient and inadequate;





- It has been determined that there are deficiencies in the tools and environment that should be implemented throughout the country;
- inadequate especially in the areas of measurement, assessment and material
- development required by the new training program.

## 1.5. Ireland

#### Legal basis in Ireland

Historically in Ireland, inclusive education was practiced as education for students with disabilities and was carried out almost exclusively in segregated settings. The medical model of disability dominated the provision of Special Education Needs (SEN). Numerous researchers (Shevlin et al, 2008, Kinsella & Senior 2008; O'Donnell, 2003) critiqued the psycho medical model in Ireland and noted the need for a cultural shift. The social model of disability, adopted in the 1980s and 1990s adopts a different attitude, perceiving that the social barriers imposed on people with disabilities, is caused by the way society is organized, rather than the person's impairment or difference. This model emphasizes the need for structural change to enable people with disabilities to take charge of their own lives in a society that is inclusive, accessible, promotes choice, values freedom and is supportive of personal rights.

The Department of Education guidelines (2007) constitutes an inclusive school as characterized by a continuous process of development and self-evaluation with a view to eliminating barriers. Mission statements, admission policies and procedures are pivotal in establishing a positive agenda for inclusion. Schools are advised to revise their culture and ethos, organizational arrangements, curriculum content and approaches to teaching and learning.

However, inclusion has been named as "the major challenge facing educational systems around the world" (Ainscow, 2005, p.109). Inclusive education has traditionally been thought of as being an approach to serving students with disabilities within general education settings (Suleymanov, 2015). The National Council for Special Education (NCSE, 2011) described inclusion as a process of addressing and responding to the diversity of needs of learners. It involves removing barriers so that each learner will be enabled to achieve the maximum benefit from his/her schooling.

In Ireland, the Further Education and Training Strategy (2014-2019) set out a strong commitment to 'active inclusion' in the Further Education and Training sector (SOLAS, 2014: 91). This was influenced by the EU Commission's definition of active inclusion (2008). This focus on inclusion was continued in the FET Strategy Future FET: Transforming Learning plan (2020-2024) which identified 'Fostering inclusion' as one of its core strategic pillars (SOLAS, 2019: 5).

Internationally inclusive education is increasingly seen more broadly as a reform that supports and welcomes diversity among all learners (Ainscow, 2005). Reflecting the broader context of increased recognition and rights, international policies of inclusion informed by a human rights approach. UNESCO contend that, in terms of education, inclusion is about how to transform education systems and other learning environments to respond to the diversity of learners. It aims towards enabling teachers and learners both to feel comfortable with diversity and to see it as a challenge and enrichment of the learning environment, rather than a problem (UNESCO, 2005: 15)





The term inclusion shifts the focus from the student to the school and society, and that inclusion aims to end discrimination and to work towards equal opportunities for all (Winter & O'Raw, 2010). Increasingly, the focus has moved to models of 'full inclusion' in an educational context, that advocates for a removal of all segregated and specialized instruction for learners with disabilities in favor of full participation in mainstream settings with the support of appropriate adaptations and accommodations (Zigmond, Kloo and Volonino, 2009). Kruse and Dedering (2018) broadly define an inclusive education system as one "where all school pupils have unrestricted access to general education and are taught together in heterogeneous and inseparable learning groups" (p. 21). "Inclusion is an attitude and approach that embraces diversity and differences and promotes equal opportunities for all" (Inclusion BC Annual Report (2019, P. 2). Inclusion has favorable effects on social-emotional skills, academic achievement, school engagement, peer acceptance, and sustainable relationships among all students (Downes et al., 2017 Pg ). Yet, extant literature points to a lag in the adoption of inclusive education by teachers and educational institutions (O'Rourke, 2015).

Section 42 Public Duty on Human Rights and Equality in the Irish Human Rights Equality Commission (IHREC) Act 2014 states that all public bodies have responsibilities to be proactive to ensure all their service users (and potential service users) are dealt with in ways which respects their human rights under equality legislation. IHREC's Section 42 act states that teachers, educators and stakeholders funded by the public purse are obligated under that legislation.

# 2. LGBTQI+ students

## 2.1 EU Wide

In January 2013, an "Inter-federal action plan against homophobic and transphobic violence" was adopted with the aim to improve awareness of sexual orientation, gender and the fight against stereotypes and discrimination through citizenship education and through the strengthening of <u>EVRAS</u>. Since then, the issue has been on the table, and various initiatives have developed within individual Member States and at EU level.

In recent years, the European Commission adopted on 12 November 2020 the <u>LGBTQI+</u> <u>Equality Strategy 2020-2025</u>, which aims to promote equality for LGBTQI++ people. The key pillars of the strategy include tackling discrimination against LGBTQI+ people, ensuring LGBTQI+ people's safety, building LGBTQI+ inclusive societies and leading the call for LGBTQI+ equality around the world. Some Member States have adopted national LGBTQI+ action plans or strategies to enhance LGBTQI+ equality.

## Tackling discrimination against LGBTQI+ people.

Whilst EU legislation prohibits employment and occupation, including access to employment and vocational training, the <u>EU Progress Report on implementing the LGBTQI+ Strategy (2020-2025)</u> asserts that LGBTQI+ persons still need to overcome barriers and prejudices to secure stable jobs. It also highlights that LGBTQI+ people face discriminatory and often violent barriers hampering their full and equal enjoyment of the right to positive physical and mental health. However, in relation to tackling these issues, the following measures were taken to combat discrimination against LGBTQI+ people.

• Strengthening of the role of equality bodies (2022)





- Recommendations on pathways to school success (2022)
- 100 Erasmus+ and European Solidarity Corps programs focusing on LGBTQI+ equality.
- Report of the Survey on Sexual orientation and Gender Identity (European Agency for Asylum, 2022)

## 1.Ensuring LGBTQI+ people's safety.

In recent years, hate speech and hate crime targeting persons and organizations supporting LGBTQI+ rights have increased globally, including across the European Union. According to the progress report, 11% of LGBTQI+ respondents in the EU were physically or sexually assaulted in the 5 years before the survey (2019). Trans and intersex respondents experienced attacks at up to twice the rate of the rest of the LGBTQI+ community. At the same time, hate speech against LGBTQI+ people remains prevalent on social platforms.

The progress report noted that 14 Member States have laws that give some degree of protection against hate speech and hate crimes based on sexual orientation or gender identity. However, it highlights that only 3 Member States have extended the scope of the legislation to include intersex people.

The report identified the following achievements in the journey towards ensuring LGBTQI+ people's safety.

- Proposal for the Council to extend the current list of EU crimes under Article 83 (1) of the Treaty on the functioning of the EU to cover hate speech and crime (2021)
- Publication of the seventh evaluation of the code of conduct on countering illegal hate speech (2022)
- Launch of an EU-wide victims' rights campaign (2023)

## 2.Building LGBTQI+ inclusive societies.

Key achievements,

- launch of an EEAS Agenda for Diversity and Inclusion 2023
- Financial support for LGBTQI+ human rights defenders under the instrument for preaccession assistance (IPA) and the Neighbourhood Development and International Cooperation Instrument (NDICI)
- EUR 15 million has been earmarked for civil society organizations for the promotion of equality, inclusion and diversity under the 2022-2024 thematic programme on human rights and democracy.

## 3.Leading the call for LGBTQI+ equality around the world

The progress made on this issue includes the following

- in 2020-2021, the human rights of LGBTQ I+ persons were raised in human rights dialogues with countries in all regions, many of which were chaired by the EU Special Representative for Human Rights, Eamon Gilmore.
- in 2023, the EEAS launched an agenda for diversity and inclusion, bringing together in one document the different equality frameworks, including the LGBTQI+ strategy. With the implementation of the 'agenda', the EEAS aims to further strengthen existing mechanisms and enhance the awareness and skills of staff when it comes to diversity and inclusion.

The <u>LGBTQI+ Inclusive Education Report and Index 2022</u> produced by our partner in TUTOR, IGLYO, provides qualitative data on a set of 10 indicators that cover anti-discrimination legislation, education policies and anti-bullying action plans, teacher training, inclusive curricula, and the existence of support systems, information and guidelines.





The report notes that whilst the aspirations and interventions as outlined above are indicators of some progression, nevertheless IGLYO's findings suggest 'there exists an almost complete standstill across the Council of Europe Region since 2018.' They note that 'only 6 Member States provide most of the recommended measures, and 10 have failed to implement any.' Based upon these findings IGLYO note that 'it is easy to understand why many LGBTQI+ young people are still experiencing high levels of violence and discrimination at school' (2022).

The report highlights that currently 6 countries have implemented anti-propaganda laws and policies, therefore learners do not receive LGBTQI+ inclusive content in schools.

'it is worrying that some countries have implemented laws to prevent teachers from talking about sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression or sex characteristics at school.' Where there are inclusive policies in existence, the report notes that 'inclusive policies do not translate into other measures, such as inclusive curricula or teacher training'. The report also highlights that 'Many teachers still report that they lack the confidence to talk about LGBTQI+ + topics and support LGBTQI+ students, yet only 2 Member States have introduced mandatory teacher training on LGBTQI+ topics.' Equally the issue of representation and visibility is important, 'Research shows that having a reactive approach to discrimination at school is not enough. The general invisibility and lack of positive representations of LGBTQI+ people in schools has negative consequences for all learners' (IGLYO 2022).

## 2.2 Greece

According to IGLYO's Inclusive Education Report and Index 2022, there are no antidiscrimination laws in Greece that refer specifically to the sexual orientation, gender identity and expression, or variations in sex characteristics as protected grounds of discrimination with regard to education.

According to the first Panhellenic Study for School Environment (2018, Color Youth - LGBTQ Community of Athens) collecting the opinions and stances of 1,963 secondary education students (including initial VET school's learners) identifying themselves as heterosexual/cisgender revealed that 84.9% of the participants had heard of discriminative phrases and words because of their sexual identity, while more than half of them, i.e., 58.1% admitted that their teachers/trainers had made homophobic remarks, which have detrimental effects on mental and physical wellbeing.

Greece has been a member of the European Governmental LGBTQI+ Focal Points Network since April 2022 and has signed UNESCO's Call for Action about inclusive and equitable Education for all learners in an environment free from discrimination and violence. Limited research regarding inclusion of LGBTQI+ students in secondary education were found. In one study by Iliopoulou, Nikolakakis, Diakoumakou & Grammenidis, (2018) the students were asked to answer questions about their everyday life at school. This included questions about the use of negative and offensive remarks from people around them (homophobic, on gender expression, transphobic, sexist or other negative remarks), safety and harassment, reporting incidents of violence or harassment. Some of the findings are that homophobic remarks are heard by other students while more than half of the students also hear such remarks from teachers. Despite their presence (which is reported sometimes by the participants) teachers rarely intervene.

These findings are also confirmed by the first Panhellenic Study about the Secondary Education's School Environment in Greece (2018, Color Youth - LGBTQ Community of Athens).





The latter reports the experiences of 1,963 LGBTQI+ learners from 13 to 20 years old in school settings. In particular, 84.9% of students hear the word "gay" in school with a negative connotation, 96% of them have heard comments related to the inconsistency of their behaviours with their gender, suggesting to students that some behaviours are not appropriate to specific genders, 74% of them report transphobic comments, 65.1% of the LGBTQI+ students report the lack of LGBTQI+ representatives in the classrooms and 1 out of 3 students have been subjected to some form of verbal harassment. Also, 34.3% of the students reported the lack of teachers' intervention in incidents of harassment and abuse or any other discriminative behavior related to the gender identity and sexual orientations of the students.

A recent law (#4491, Government Gazette A' 152/13-10-2017, "Legal Recognition of Gender Identity - National Mechanism for the Development, Monitoring and Evaluation of Action Plans for Students' Rights and other provisions") refers to the rights of a person based on gender identity and gender characteristics. However, the emphasis on the necessity of valuing and respecting persons' gender identity and gender characteristics does not always correspond to a concrete action plan towards the inclusion of LGBTQI+ students in education.

In particular, there are no policies about the protection of LGBTQI+ students against discrimination in education and school settings. The anti-discrimination legislation is focused more on the LGBTQI+ people protection in employment (SOGIGESC) and access in services and basic goods (SOGI) than the education section.

Under Greek government's responsibility, a National Strategy for Equality of LGBTQI+ people (2021-2023) prepared by a commission of experts including academics and civil society representatives in 2021. During the same year, the commission proceeded with the publication of a chapter on addressing exclusion from education.

The main points were related to the minimized access of LGBTQI+ people to education and a series of measurements that should be taken, such as inclusive curricula, robust support systems, and specific guidelines for LGBTQI+ learners and teachers. However, a limited number of these recommendations have been implemented, which results in the reproduction of stereotypes and the perpetuation of distorted perceptions.

The existing curricula does not include LGBTQI+ references and representations of Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity, Gender Expression and Sex Characteristics Unit (SOGIGESC). Over the last two years, the Ministry of Education takes the initiative to create "Skills Laboratories" including "Live better" lessons including the topic of sex education as an optional lesson. The first step towards the sex education was the pilot testing of the lesson during the academic year 2020/2021 in specific school settings to define its efficiency and the benefits for the students.

## 2.3 Austria

#### **Existing Status**

The "Homosexuelle Initiative Salzburg" ("HOSI") is a non-profit association that conducted the first nationwide study on the topic of "Homosexual School Time" in 2005. School time is the time of "coming out" for a large part of homosexual people. The isolation that homosexual pupils experience during this time is shown by the fact that only one third of the interviewees had come out during their school years, although they were mostly aware of their sexual orientation. For the study, a questionnaire published on the internet was filled





out by 468 gay (90%) and bisexual (10%) men on how they felt and experienced their school years as students and teenagers - with worrying results (Hosi, 2005):

- At 17% the suicide attempt rate among the study participants is very high
- Approx. 50% of students who came out as gay experienced discrimination at school because of their sexual orientation
- Only 16% of the participants reported that teachers intervened in cases of discrimination.
- Most participants did not receive information on the topic of "homo- and bisexuality" from school during their school years
- 70% of those participants rated the teachers as not at all or less competent
- Only 3% of the respondents mentioned school doctors, school psychologists and teachers as potential contact persons

The 2015 study "Queer in Vienna - Living situation of lesbians, gays, bisexuals, transgender queer persons and intersexuals (LGBTQI+)" with 3,161 participants, explored living conditions in Vienna, outing experiences of discrimination, health and satisfaction with the city's services, and produced the following findings:

- 48 % of participants are not fully outed at work.
- 10 % have come out to all their superiors, 8 per cent to all their colleagues.
- 14 % have felt discriminated against at work or have been bullied or harassed in the last 12 months.
- There are no obvious differences in the responses provided by the people of the LGBTQI+ community.

According to the "Inclusive Education Report and Index 2022" of IGLYO "In the context of education, more than a third of learners have experienced violence. An online survey shows that 28% of young people are not out in an education setting (mainly students). Furthermore, the term gay is still being used as an insult on a regular basis." (P. 28) and "Both the Grundsatzerlass Sexualpädagogik and Ausgesprochen<sup>2</sup> aimed at increasing the visibility of LGBTQI+ issues in schools, faced major public opposition – particularly from conservative, right-wing / catholic organisations and parents associations.

## **Desired Status**

Discrimination in public spaces, homophobia and transphobia must no longer be part of the social tone, conclude the authors of the WASt study (2015) for the City of Vienna. People who observe such assaults are called upon to stand up and speak out against them.

The LGBTQI+ students who were also surveyed in the 2005 HOSI study (estimates range from 60,000 to 120,000 throughout Austria) also reported positive factors. Thus, the well-being of homosexual pupils increased significantly better if:

• there was someone (especially teachers) with whom they could talk about homo- and bisexuality



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Grundsatzerlass Sexualpädagogik<sup>2</sup>Basic Decree on Sex Education of the Ministry of Education from 2015) and poster campaign by the LGBTQI+ teachers' organisation Ausgesprochen, Relevant teaching material on its website <u>http://www.verein-ausgesprochen.at/</u>).



- there were openly homosexual teachers at the school
- teachers intervened against anti-gay discrimination
- brochures on the subject were available at school
- LGBTQI+ issues were discussed in the classroom.

The awareness of the problem of discrimination should be raised among all those responsible for schools. The concepts of the LGBTQI+ movement should be included in all curricula of Austrian schools and implemented in the training and further education of teachers. For the estimated 5,000 to 10,000 homosexual teachers (and of course all other sexual orientations), there must be open and unequivocal support from the school authorities. Information materials (folders, brochures, etc.) in schools would raise awareness and educate. There should be clear guidelines for dealing with discrimination.

## 2.4 Turkey

Although gender-based discrimination is prohibited in the Constitution and many other documents (IGLYO, LGBTQI Inclusive Education Report 2022), comprehensive arrangements have not been made to make educational settings inclusive for students of different sexual orientations. A comprehensive regulation on the education of LGBTQI + (lesbian, gay, bisexual, transexual, Queer and intersex) students is also missing in international legislation. In addition, it is a situation that should be questioned whether the positive regulations in the legislation find sufficient response in practice. Girls in Turkey may face significant barriers to education, particularly in rural areas and in families with traditional gender roles. Early marriage, gender-based violence, and discriminatory attitudes toward girls' education is also preventing girls and women from accessing and completing primary and secondary education. The reports of the committee following the conventions to which Turkey is part of also show that there are many obstacles to be overcome in practice. (IGLYO, Inclusive Education Report, 2022, pp.155-157).

It seems like a challenging undertaking for teachers to include LGBTQI+ students in their classes. Students that identify as LGBTQI+ in Turkey face complicated issues, including in the classroom. Lack of acceptance and understanding from their peers and teachers is one of the biggest problems for LGBTQI+ students in Turkey. Many LGBTQI+ adolescents experience isolation and lack of support at school as a result of cultural and religious standards that frequently see LGBTQI+ identities as immoral or aberrant. Poor mental health outcomes, reduced academic achievement, and even complete school abandonment can result from this.

In Turkey, there are very few services and supports accessible for LGBTQI+ students, which adds to the difficulties they already experience. Many schools lack established LGBTQI+ support groups or organizations, and teachers may lack the knowledge and tools needed to successfully serve LGBTQI+ students. Because of this, it may be challenging for LGBTQI+ students to find the tools and assistance they need to succeed in school.

## 2.5 Ireland

According to the European Union progress report on the implementation of the LGBTQI+ Strategy 2020-2025, the Irish LGBTQI+ Inclusion Strategy was underpinned by a 'robust consultation process'. Specific workshop sessions were organized also for applicants for international protection, migrants, and refugees to ensure that the voices of the more marginalized members of the LGBTQI+ community were adequately heard. As a part of the Strategy, the Irish government committed (i) to develop a broad LGBTQI+ policy, including a





transgender accommodation policy, to promote equality, take account of self-determined identity and to ensure that the safety and wellbeing of all residents is promoted; (ii) to finalize and adopt the national standards for accommodation offered to people in the protection process; (iii) to continue to work with the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees to monitor/review the handling of applications relating to sexual orientation and/or gender identity within the International Protection Process, and ensure updated LGBTQI+ cultural competence training is rolled out to staff working within the International Protection Office.

The LGBTQI+ Inclusion Strategy (2017-2019) builds on existing equality policy and is situated within the framework of safeguards provided by Ireland's equality legislation. The national strategy offers a framework in which to address intersectionality (where people may be subject to discrimination on more than one of the nine equality grounds, i.e., gender, marital status, family status, sexual orientation, religion, age, disability, race and membership of the Traveller community. It is intended in this regard that the structures overseeing this LGBTQI+ Strategy will link with other relevant policies relating to the National Strategy for Women and Girls, the LGBTQI+ Youth Strategy, the Migrant Integration Strategy, the National Disability Inclusion Strategy and the National Traveller and Roma Inclusion Strategy to enable crosscutting issues affecting LGBTQI+ people who are Travellers, Roma, people with disabilities, migrants, young people, or women to be addressed in a more systematic way.

The National Youth Strategy (2015-2020) identified LGBTQI+ young people as a specific group to be considered in the context of focused provision for marginalized young people. While their situation has improved considerably in Ireland over recent years, significant challenges remain for LGBTQI+ young people today. This categorization suggests that this group would benefit from greater support to ensure that they can achieve the same positive outcomes as all other young people. However, the provision of this support is challenging when the population cannot be easily mapped or quantified with empirical data. Ireland has however, equality legislation in place to counter discrimination based on sexual orientation, and the ongoing work of several organizations focused on supporting LGBTQI+ young people and advocating for their rights, such as BeLonG To, Transgender Equality Network Ireland (TENI), LGBT Ireland and ShoutOut, ensures implementation of legislation and policy. These organizations have developed a range of action plans, guidelines and initiatives with schools to support LGBTQI+ young people in schools as well as the wider school community.

## 3. Migrant, Refugee and Asylum-Seeking Students

## 3.1. EU Wide

With the contemporary waves of migration into Europe, both economic and refugee, the policy interventions firstly focused upon the integration of migrants into the educational system, by providing host country language supports. The concept of integration is now shifting towards greater reflection upon how best to include migrants from many countries in a real and meaningful way. To this effect, the movement has trended beyond intercultural education, which was experienced as limited in its capacity to have meaningful impact, towards a more inclusive and holistic, person centered approach to inclusivity that has emerged in the policy and strategy documents, and within European Commission policy directives. Overwhelmingly in relation to policy direction 'consultation with stakeholders has resulted in a shift of emphasis from integration to inclusion' (p. 16) and an understanding of the complex and diverse nature of migration and ethnicity, as well as the impact of experiences of othering and racialization for students from minority backgrounds.





The European Action plan on Integration and Inclusion (2021-2027) is a comprehensive framework that commits to ensuring the integration and inclusion of both migrants and EU citizens with a migrant background. The EU anti-racism action plan 2020-2025 is another strategic document that acknowledges the right of students from all racial or ethnic backgrounds to have equal access to inclusive education. The plan acknowledges that,

- Negative social perspective on migrants/refugees and racialized minorities permeates educational institutions, along with resistance from some educators to deal with the necessary changes to teach the target group. Certainly, the group of refugee learners too often gets perceived as problematic rather than holding the potential to bring in new positive opportunities to the classroom.
- European secondary school policies often **do not recognize the complexity and specificity of needs of migrant/refugee students**. In general, there is a lack of a comprehensive system of support to them and tackle the inequalities and educational barriers that this group of disadvantaged students face. For instance, research indicates that school structures are unable to accommodate the influx of immigrants and manage social and ethnic plurality, the socioeconomic status of the family of origin, and the personal history of the individual.
- The alienation of families with a migrant background or families from ethnic minorities and their lack of participation in school activities and school life is an important obstacle to inclusive education and a factor that triggers school segregation. The lack of relevant policies to stimulate parental involvement in education generates cultural distance between these families and the school, strengthens social closure and reduces opportunities for intercultural contacts.

## 3.2. Greece

As far as the inclusion of migrant students is concerned, there have been actions taken to integrate migrant students into education through zones of integrated classes. However, when they are involved in mainstream classrooms, there is little support for their inclusion and as a result they are often excluded from the learning process.

With regard to the inclusion of Roma students, it is important to note that a huge number of them remain out of school education or drop out at an early age across the country. The main debate about their exclusion and marginalization should be on two levels: the right to compulsory education and the right to education suitable to their needs. Although there is no legislation and therefore no applicable practice on inclusive education in formal education in the country, many teachers seem to be motivated to provide equal opportunities for all students in their classrooms. To succeed in doing so, they use several strategies and practices of inclusive education, such as learning in informal learning environments, using alternative teaching methods and learning resources, as well as involving parents and local community. All these contribute to promoting inclusive education. On the other hand, there are teachers who are not aware of the effective ways and tools to intervene in any type of violence and prevent students from discriminating conducts.

The limited number of inclusive education trainings for teachers and trainers in lower and upper secondary education, and the identified challenges and issues emerging leads to the necessity of enhancing teachers' education to contribute to the development of inclusive teachers fostering inclusive learning environments and turning education into an area for all people to thrive and flourish.





"Training does not yet seem to succeed in conveying a comprehensive and effective picture of inclusion that encompasses all diversity dimensions. Inclusion is indeed seen positively by students and graduates in a normative sense, as enrichment for all, with the development of empathy skills, perceiving the needs of others, acceptance and tolerance being cited as core values." (Feyerer, 2016, p. 180-189) The quality of integration is strongly associated with existing or non- existing resources and is often used as the central criterion for success or failure.

The Ministry of Education strives to implement several multiple policies to include refugees and migrants in the Hellenic educational system. During the academic year 2021-2022, the education was strengthened with 1,578 teachers, who were hired in 110 Refugee Education Reception Centers and Reception Classes in secondary education throughout the country, while 87 teachers were appointed with the role of Refugee Education Coordinators, and the reactivation of the interpretation programme in schools was implemented. In particular, the educational policies on the inclusion of refugees and migrant students in schools are directed in three main pillars

- Reception and integration system
- Supporting materials for students
- Supporting material for teachers

This training program is implemented in cooperation between the Universities of Athens, University of Thessaloniki, University of Thessaly, University of Ioannina, University of Patras, and the University of Crete, and the UNICEF Office in Greece, in the framework of the program "All Students in Education," with the support of the Ministry of Education and Religious Affairs, under the supervision of the Institute of Educational Policy (IEP).

The "Teach for Integration" program is part of a broader effort by the Ministry of Education to provide training, information, professional development, and adequate support to teachers.

The establishment of intercultural education in Greece was made with the legislative framework of 1996, which concerns "Greek education abroad, the education abroad, intercultural education and other provisions". In this context, the Institute for Education of the Homogeneous and Intercultural Education was established, for the adoption and approval of programs and books and the preparation of teaching material, to facilitate the integration of foreign students as much as possible.

The Institute for Education of the Homogeneous and Intercultural Education cooperates with the Pedagogical Institute, the Centre for the Greek Language, educational institutions and other bodies (Rapaith, 2016, p. 35) providing a more flexible programme, which, in combination with the regular classroom, caters for the needs of students' special needs (Nikolaou, 2008).

In intercultural schools, bilingual programs are designed, and the focus language is English rather than Greek. A prerequisite for the characterization to be considered an intercultural school is that the foreign or returning students constitute at least 45% of the total student population. These schools teach the programs of the corresponding public schools, adapting them to the educational and social needs of the migrant students (Tirtiopoflou & Kotiamanth, 2008, op. cit. available at Rapadi, 2018, p. 35). Their purpose is to contribute to the all-round





and harmonious development of learners' skills, irrespective of their age and background, to create a fully-fledged workforce (cf. Government Gazette, 1985).

## 3.3. Austria

#### Existing Status

Existing data situation of the study by the "Austrian Council for Research and Technology Development" (Expertenrat für Integration, 2020), provides extensive information on students with a migration background regarding origin conversational or colloquial language as well as performance differences related to migration, however there is little to no information on educators, teachers and school psychologists, etc. with a migration background, as no meaningful data is known on them. From interviews with various stakeholders in the field of migration and discussions with focus groups, important points were identified. It is evident that many measures already implemented are not sufficiently effective, as the relevance of the topic has not yet reached all sectors of society. The standardization of measures, especially for language support, is also seen as important. Targeted assistance for already well-educated migrants and better international networking would serve as an engine for growth and the so-called "brain circulation".

#### **Desired Status**

The Council identifies the following need for optimization: (Expertenrat für Integration, 2020, p. 105)

- Anchoring multicultural education as a focus in pedagogical training
- Recruitment of migrants for pedagogical professions
- More resources for language support
- Networking of parents and actors of educational institutions
- Simplified recognition of qualifications acquired abroad
- Equal treatment of EU/EEA and third-country nationals in terms of labor law.

The standardized teacher survey (TALIS) carried out by the OECD in some countries in 2018 showed that for Austria, in response to the topic: "Training and preparation for multiculturally diverse teaching by age of teachers" In the Teacher Questionnaire TALIS 2018 (Bruneforth, 2018, p. 90) the question of whether "teaching in a multicultural or multilingual environment" was part of the formal training was answered "yes" by only less than one third of the teachers. However, it should be noted here that this question was answered by all teachers, including those who stated that this aspect was NOT part of their training. With regard to the training on teaching in multiculturally diverse classes and also with regard to the extent to which teachers felt prepared for this, the age of the teachers plays a major role: the younger the teachers, the more often they report that "multicultural diversity in the classroom" was part of their training, while 3% of the 50-59 year old and 2% of the over 60 year old state that they felt very well prepared by their training, this applies to 14% of the under 24 year old teachers. Well prepared was felt by 19% of those under 24 and 21% of those 25-29, but only 6% of those 50-59 and 7% of teachers over 60. The differences between the youngest and oldest groups are statistically significant for both perceived level of preparation and training. These results also provide evidence for Austria of the continuous adaptation of teacher training to the needs of students reported by the OECD (2019). (Bruneforth, 2018, p. 90)

## 3.4. Turkey

Since the early 15th century, the Ottoman Empire has always welcomed hundreds of thousands of Spanish, Armenian, and Portuguese Jews along with Russians, Polish and





Europeans in search of political asylum in the course of over 600 years. Turkey has always been a refuge for people from various cultures and ethnicity driven by either political or economic factors. In fact, Turkey is adequately set with the mix of cultures within its domains that social and cultural issues are not major concerns of the Turkish (Educational Development and Infrastructure for Immigrants and Refugees, Ch 3, p. 19). Turkey's pursuit to provide the same level of quality of education to students from all cultural dimensions in various European universities is embodied in the Sorbonne Declaration. According to the Constitution, teaching languages other than Turkish to Turkish citizens in schools is prohibited. Article 2 of the Law on Foreign Language Education and Teaching and Learning Different Languages and Dialects of Turkish Citizens states that "different languages and dialects traditionally used by Turkish citizens in their daily lives" can be taught through private courses and private schools can be opened to provide education and training in these languages. These private schools and private courses are subject to the Law on Private Education Institutions. According to this law, only the students of the citizens of the Republic of Turkey who belong to the minority can study in minority schools. According to the Regulation on the Education of Students of Migrant Workers, students of migrant workers can benefit from education opportunities in Turkey, compulsory education also covers students of migrant workers. According to the Regulation, it is among the duties of the Directorates of National Education to place the students of migrant workers in schools close to the schools they attend in the countries they come from, to open courses for the teaching of their mother tongue as much as possible, and to take measures for the migrant students who do not speak Turkish to learn Turkish. (p.15)

According to the laws in Turkey, including foreigners, all students in Turkey, primary and secondary education are entitled to free education (ili, 2018). Integration of refugees to the countries they migrate to can be realized by being included in the education system (p. 32) and has a decisive and important function in terms of social cohesion (Ercetin, Potas and Açıkalın, 2017). However, refugees and asylum seekers in Turkey also face significant barriers to education, particularly due to language barriers and lack of access to educational resources. Many refugee and asylum-seeking students have experienced interrupted or limited access to education in their home countries and may face difficulties in accessing the Turkish education system. Refugee students may be excluded from the education system due to cultural and social exclusion, language barriers and poor living conditions (Rossi, 2008). Important facts regarding migration flows as a result of several wars, e.g., Syrian refugees are 4.5% of population in a total school enrolment rate of 61%. Taştan and Çelik (2017) summarize the reasons why Syrian students do not fully benefit from educational services including factors such as "Syrian students' not speaking Turkish lack of transportation facilities, indifference of teachers and school administrators, physical insufficiency of schools and uncertainties" (Taştan and Çelik, 2017). However, the Integration of Syrian Students in Turkish Education System (PICTES) Project implemented by MoNE (Ministry of National Education of the Republic of Turkey) together with the EU since 2016 accelerated their integration into the Turkish education system by enabling Syrians to benefit from educational services (https://piktes.gov.tr/cms/).

## 3.5. Ireland

The Department of Justice and Equality's (2017) <u>Migrant Integration Strategy</u>: A Blueprint for the Future (2017-2020), defines integration in current Irish policy as the "ability to participate to the extent that a person needs and wishes in all of the major components of society without having to relinquish his or her own cultural identity" (p. 11). The Strategy identifies actions





including those designed to encourage those from migrant and minority ethnic backgrounds into the teaching profession. "Proactive efforts will be made to attract migrants into teaching positions" (p. 25). Action 31 states "The effectiveness of training for teachers on managing diversity and tackling racism will be reviewed." Action 36 states "The fostering and development of positive attitudes towards diversity and celebrating difference will continue to form part of the school curriculum." (p. 26).

Two additional key policies include the National Action Plan against Racism and the National Plan for Equity of Access to Higher Education have significant implications for education.

## 4. Socio-economic disadvantaged students

Socio economic disadvantage refers to living in less favorable social and economic circumstances than the majority of others in the same society. These circumstances arise from a complex interplay of factors such as poverty, health, housing, education, and family background, and the resulting lack of opportunities and expectation open to people. It refers to deprivation of material, cultural and social resources in life, relative to others which leads to exclusion from participation in society (Wightman & Danziger, 2012). It has been associated with experiences of persistent intergenerational disadvantage, exclusion and marginalization, and acknowledges that schools and colleges are major institutions of selection and stratification for the labor market as they mediate life chances within the economy (Lynch and Baker, 2005:5) Groups defined by socio economic disadvantage have traditionally been defined by occupational background, such as working class or unemployed groups.

The PISA study measures the socio-economic background of students by using the ESCS-Index of Economic, Social and Cultural Status. Within this index the parent's occupational status, highest educational attainment and material resources (family wealth, cultural goods and educational resources) are considered. Students are rated as socio-economically advantaged if their ESCS score is in the top 25% of the national distribution, whereas students whose ESCS score is in the bottom 25% of the national distribution are said to be socio-economically disadvantaged.

Contemporary definitions highlight the need to move away from singular definition by occupation to be cognizant of the intersection of different factors within experiences of socioeconomic disadvantage such as Bourdieu's model of social, economic and cultural capital (Bourdieu and Passeron, 1977). Such models highlight how class is experienced not only economically, but is often lived as a negative identity, marked by shame and judgement (Skeggs, 2004; Reay & Lucey, 2004; Sayer, 2005).

## 4.1. EU Wide

Socio economic disadvantaged students include those at a risk of poverty, educational disadvantaged, geographical barriers, marginalized and ethnic groups, including Traveller and Roma. A number of strategy and policy documents address the challenges associated with socio- economic disadvantaged students, including intersectionality at EU level. These include:

- The Action plan on Integration and Inclusion 2021-2027
- The 2013 Commission Recommendation 'Investing in Students: breaking the cycle of disadvantage
- The European Pillar of Social Rights
- The EU Roma strategic framework on equality, inclusion and participation





- Proposal for a draft Council Recommendation on Roma equality, inclusion and participation
- Commission Staff Working Document: analytical document accompanying the EU Roma strategic framework for equality, inclusion and participation
- European Commission (2020): EU Roma strategic framework for equality, inclusion and participation for 2020 2030
- IGLYO (2022): LGBTQI+ Inclusive Education Report 2022

**Prevalence of school segregation**. School segregation is still an unfortunate reality in Europe today. It is a key driver of inequality regarding educational and vocational opportunities and the reproduction of social deprivation on ethnic and racial grounds. Its negative consequences affect Roma students, learners with disabilities, students with a migrant background. Research indicates there is a tendency to group marginalized and disadvantaged students in the same classroom or school, generating inequalities. Despite existing anti-discrimination legislation and policies, the practice of separating groups of pupils in specific schools or classes may even be growing, including because of the increase in the arrival of migrants and refugees in Europe. Installation of segregated schools are often induced by residential segregation, school admission rules or free school choice.

On 12 March 2021, the EU Council adopted a supplementary recommendation on equality, inclusion and participation of Roma, with which the Member States are to renew and strengthen their political commitment to the inclusion of Roma in the areas of education, employment, equality and inclusion.

## 4.2. Greece

Greece has adopted National Roma Integration Strategies (NRIS). "At least 10% of Roma students aged 7 to 15 in Greece, Romania, Bulgaria, Italy and France were identified in a 2012 survey by the Fundamental Rights Agency as not attending school. This proportion is highest in Greece, with more than 35% of Roma students not attending school. According to the Roma students in Greece and multidimensional poverty and the National Strategy and Action Plan for Roma Social Inclusion 2021-2030, Roma families' poverty rate is 96% compared to the 22% of the general population.

"The educational integration of the Roma is obstructed by a. The active exclusion of Romani students, either through the vigorous mobilization of the local community – with violence, or more often with threats – or through milder administrative means. b. The passive exclusion of Romani students in the school classroom, through the simple acceptance of their presence and their marginalization." (Vergidis, 2014).

The Roma Civil Society Monitoring Report in Greece states that 69% of the Roma students attend the compulsory education and a limited number of them, almost 9%, complete the upper secondary education based on the FRA MIDIS II (European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, 2018)<sup>3</sup>. The Greek NRIS highlights the main action that should be implemented by 2030 is to enhance the equal access of Roma to basic social services and, particularly, in education. Stamatis, General Secretariat for Social Solidarity and Fight against Poverty, states that it is necessary to support education interventions in Roma communities, provide scholarships for Roma students in secondary education, upgrade the educational material to support the acquisition of their skills, and the design and development of a cultural

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> https://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra\_uploads/fra-2016-eu-minorities-survey-roma-selected-findings\_el.pdf



Co-funded by the European Union

Views and opinions expressed are however those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or EACEA. Neither the European Union nor the granting authority can be held responsible for them.



mediation program supporting schools. At the present time, the Reception and Integration system implemented focuses not only on the integration of the migrant and refugee students, but also in the efficient integration of Roma students.

In Greece within the framework of National Strategy & Action Plan for Roma Social Inclusion 2021 - 2030, (Ministry of Labor and Social Services) a four -pillar NRIS Action Plan 2021 – 2030 was developed, including teacher training for inclusive education based on the analysis in the framework of Child Guarantee - UNICEF & University of Thessaly & National and Kapodistrian University of Athens.

Cosmaidi states in the study "Social and Educational Discrimination of Roma students" gathering information from teachers in Reception Classes of Roma Students that "equal opportunities are definitely not given to them because they do not have the same financial situation", "not because they don't have the pressure from home, they are much more relaxed when they go to their school, they are marginalized". (Cosmaidi, 2018)

## 4.3. Austria

Three main factors reduce the chances of Austrian young people: educationally disadvantaged background, low socio-economic status of the family and non-German everyday language. In families with a migration background, several of these risk factors often coincide. The highest completed school education of the parents is still the measure of the child's education. It correlates with both school performance and the degrees achieved. Education is inherited to a considerable extent in Austria. The Austrian education researcher Barbara Herzog-Punzenberger attests to a serious deficit in Austrian teaching staff: "Our teachers have no basic sociological education and do not know what society looks like beyond their own milieu. It's not just about the middle class, which is 16% of the population. It's about 100%." (Meinhart, & Hofer, 2020).

According to the index of social disadvantage", which is based on four parameters: the proportion of pupils from socially disadvantaged families, from educationally disadvantaged families, families with a migration background and the proportion of students with a non-German everyday language, the social burden of individual schools can be defined. At the highly stressed end of the scale reside the "hotspot schools" which are in locations with "high social disadvantage", 64% of students "do not" or "only partially" achieve the PISA educational standards in German. This compares to only 32% in schools with "low social disadvantage". In 2019, more students went to so-called "hotspot schools" than in previous years. (Oberwimmer, 2018, p. 38-46)

The goal of the Austrian school system is to encourage pupils to follow the educational path that is suitable for them individually by "Raising the achievement and educational level of students and target groups in adult education, improving needs orientation as well as opportunity and gender equity in education, and building gender and diversity competence in all educational pathways." (Bundesministerium Bildung, Wissenschaft und Forschung, BMBWF/1).

#### Facts and Figures on Migrants and Roma

In 2018, 2,262,834 students and adolescents (0 to 24 years) lived in Austria (almost a quarter of the total population). Of these, 284,055 were young migrants (EU- and non-EU-states). This corresponds to 12.6% of the total youth population (Integrationsbericht, 2022, p. 37). Turkish students and young people made up the largest group, followed by Serbia and Montenegro.







Students with non-German mother tongue (foreign and native) in Austria.

In the capital Vienna, the number of students with a non-German mother tongue is as high as 51.2%.

Of the approximately 1,100,000 students and adolescents who attended school in 2018, German was the most common language spoken in everyday life and in the family household for around 820,000 (74.7%). 306,300 (25.3%) had a language other than German in the household. This circumstance does not equate to a lack of German language skills in all cases, but it can be an indicator that there is a potential need to catch up in the acquisition of German. Without sufficient knowledge of German, the acquisition of the educational content of all other school subjects is also possible only to a limited extent. About achieving the legally prescribed competence goals, a non-German colloquial language is therefore considered a risk factor. Special attention must be paid to the high proportion of students with a migration background and foreign colloquial language in special needs schools. As the Expert Council for Integration already emphasised in the Integration Report 2021, it is important from an integration perspective that students who have a need for language support but are not cognitively impaired receive tailored support and do not end up in a special needs school. The proportions of young people with a non-German colloquial language were significantly lower in vocational schools (19%) and in general secondary schools (22%). In these types of schools, there are too few students and young people with a migration background and non-German colloquial language - measured by their share of all peers. This form of unequal distribution in the Austrian education system has a negative impact on the further educational careers of students with a migration background, because without a higher education entrance examination it is considerably more difficult to take up (highly) qualified professions. Without further education/training, the more stable and better paid positions on the labour market remain difficult to reach for them. In view of an education system whose structures do not specifically compensate for inequality of opportunity among students and young people, both a low occupational status and a low formal education of the parents represent significant obstacles to the educational success of adolescents as well as to their chances on the labour market (Integrationsbericht, 2022, p. 38).

With over 12 million people, the Roma represent the largest ethnic minority in Europe. Many of them face discrimination, prejudice and social exclusion. In Austria, the term "Roma" is used as an umbrella term for different groups such as Burgenland Roma, Sinti, Lovara, Kalderash and others. The Council of Europe and institutions of the European Union also use



Co-funded by the European Union



the term "Roma" as an umbrella term, as conveyed, among other things, in the most recent report of the "EU Roma strategic framework for equality, inclusion and participation for 2020 - 2030" from 2020. Austria first submitted a report to the European Commission in 2012 on the "EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020 - Policy and Legal Measures in Austria". The current Austrian "Strategy for the Continuation of Roma Inclusion in Austria" already contains all key points and target formulations from the new fields of action of the EU Roma Framework 2030. Specifically, it sets priorities in the following areas: Education, labour market, combating antiziganism, empowerment of female Roma (Romnja), strengthening organised Roma civil society and participation (Bundeskanzleramt, BMFFJI, 2021, p. 2).

Whilst the following experiences of antiziganism is specific to the Austria context, it is relevant to and applies across the EU. To this day, so-called "antiziganism" is a major structural driver of Roma exclusion in all European societies, undermining the process of Roma inclusion and reinforcing their disadvantage over generations, as the "European Agency for Fundamental Rights", among others, has repeatedly found. Many civil society actors believe that EU Roma integration policy would benefit from a stronger focus on combating antiziganism. In the final evaluation of the "EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies to 2020", the European Commission identified the lack of specific non-discrimination targets and targeted strategies to combat antiziganism as key weaknesses of the current EU framework.

#### Definition of "antiziganism"

"The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) of the Council of Europe defines anti-Gypsyism as a 'specific form of racism, an ideology founded on racial superiority, a form of dehumanisation and institutional racism nurtured by historical discrimination, which is expressed, among others, by violence, hate speech, exploitation, stigmatisation and the most blatant kind of discrimination'. The Alliance Against Antigypsyism uses the following working definition (and different spelling): 'Antigypsyism is a historically constructed, persistent complex of customary racism against social groups identified under the stigma 'gypsy' or other related terms and incorporates: 1. a homogenizing and essentializing perception and description of these groups; 2. the attribution of specific characteristics to them; 3. discriminating social structures and violent practices that emerge against that background, which have a degrading and ostracizing effect and which reproduce structural disadvantages." (EU Roma strategic framework, 2020, p. 5)

European Commission (2020): EU Roma strategic framework for equality, inclusion and participation for 2020 - 2030 suggests that existing patterns of discrimination are often reproduced by state institutions and anti-Roma stereotypes still prevail, which do not grant the Roma minority the same degree of protection as the "non-Roma".

#### **Desired Status**

To overcome this structural anti-gypsyism, institutional learning and controls by diverse political, governmental and civil organisations are key, (Chancellery of Austria, 2019, p. 9) Meanwhile, the EU programme of "National Roma Integration Strategies" has been extended and adapted until 2030. Based on this, the national "Strategy for the Continuation of Roma Inclusion in Austria" also exists, also ongoing until 2030 (cf. Bundeskanzleramt, BMFFJI, 2021) aims to effectively combat discrimination against Roma by:





- Keeping the fight against antiziganism on the agenda of future EU Presidencies is crucial to achieve clear results
- Establish and strengthen monitoring structures to also obtain comprehensive data for evaluation purposes
- Recognising and combating antiziganism as a specific form of racism in individual national political agendas
- Establish so-called "Truth and Reconciliation Commissions" to build trust and promote recognition of the historical responsibility of governments and those perceived as "gypsies"

## 4.4. Turkey

Turkey has managed to improve student achievement while increasing access to education. Over the past decade, significant investment and reform to Turkey's education system have enabled a major expansion in participation. Over the past decade, Turkey's strong economic development has enabled a sharp decline in absolute poverty, with the share of people living below the Turkish poverty line dropping from 28.8% in 2003 to 16% in 2014 (OECD, 2016[1]). Nevertheless, relative poverty and income inequality are still among the highest within the OECD. The share of youth not in employment, education or training (NEET) while dropping, is more than double the OECD average and almost three times higher for women (Turkey: 46, OECD average: 16).

Students from low-income families face significant barriers to education due to financial constraints and lack of resources. They may not have access to basic educational materials or adequate school facilities. In addition, students in rural areas often face significant challenges in accessing education due to distance and transportation issues.

The individuals who are considered to be from fewer opportunities or disadvantaged backgrounds mostly include those from low-income families, those living in rural areas, refugees and asylum seekers, students with disabilities, and girls.

The rate of socioeconomic disadvantaged students in Turkey is more than 60%. <sup>4</sup>In Turkey, especially in vocational education, this rate is 80%. One of the main challenges facing socioeconomically disadvantaged students in Turkey is poverty. Many of these students come from low-income families that struggle to provide necessities such as food, clothing, and shelter. This makes it difficult for them to afford the materials and resources necessary to succeed in school, such as textbooks, computers, and other educational materials. It also leads to issues such as hunger, poor health, and social isolation, which can further impact their ability to learn and succeed in school.

Numerous efforts and programs in Turkey are designed to aid socio-economically disadvantaged pupils to address these issues. For instance, the government has put in place several laws and initiatives aimed at lowering poverty and enhancing access to education, such as providing low-income students with free textbooks and transportation. In addition, numerous non-governmental organizations and neighbourhood associations are trying to offer additional help and resources to underprivileged pupils, including tutoring, mentorship, and after-school programs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> UIS Statistics on Education, http://data.uis.unesco.org/?lang=en&SubSessionId=bc815974-9c38-4285-ba51-cf20d695f746&themetreeid=-200 (accessed on 1 February 2018).





There is still more to be done to support socioeconomically disadvantaged pupils in Turkey, notwithstanding these efforts. These pupils' success in school and beyond is constrained by ongoing poverty, discrimination, and limited access to opportunities and resources. However, educators and advocates can contribute to the development of a more equitable and inclusive educational system in Turkey by continuing to raise awareness of these concerns and striving to provide additional support and resources to students from disadvantaged backgrounds.

#### **Roma Students**

The fundamental problems faced by Roma in the field of education include the fact that some Roma students are not registered in the education system, low attendance rates, poor school performance, and early dropouts. Living in poverty leads some Roma families to send their students to work as part of their survival strategy. According to studies in the field, Roma students are obliged to work in order to contribute to the family budget, and this obligation leads many students to abandon their schooling. Those students who do continue their education often choose to hide their identity due to fear of discrimination. While the participation rate of Roma students in formal education is low according to the Roma Education Fund Organization<sup>5</sup>, there exists a practice of traditional education handed down from parents to students starting from a very young age, particularly among Roma groups who are practising musicians.

Within the education system studies (for example, Balestra, C. and L. Fleischer (2018), "Diversity statistics in the OECD: How do OECD countries collect data on ethnic, racial and indigenous identity?", OECD Statistics Working Papers) show that the marginalisation of Roma students in the school environment accelerates their disengagement from school. In classes or schools where there is a majority of Roma students, the parents of non-Roma students or educational staff often decide to remove non-Roma pupils from the class or school in question, leading to the creation of segregated classes or schools that contain only Roma students. This situation has a negative effect of the quality of education in the schools in question. This educational segregation is a problem that exists in practice but is not part of the legal regulations of Turkey's education system. A significant majority of Roma citizens face problems related to accommodation, and these problems have a negative effect on the educational performance of Roma students. Early marriage happens in the Roma community, the average age of marriage is 15-16 years. While multiple studies present early marriage as one of the factors in student's disengagement from school, other research has found that by the time Roma students reach the age of marriage many have already left school and entered working life (EPRS | European Parliamentary Research Service, 2023<sup>6</sup>).

#### 4.5. Ireland

The notion of equality of opportunity in Irish education was espoused periodically over several decades, but no significant steps were ever really taken to achieve it (Harford, 2018). Internationally and nationally educational policy is focused upon widening of participation of socio-economic disadvantaged students. In Ireland, the main policy initiative in school for socio-economic disadvantage is the Delivering Equality of Opportunity in Schools (DEIS). DEIS is a targeted intervention to support schools which have high levels of educationally disadvantaged students. The DEIS Plan 2017 sets out the Department of Education and Skills policy and supports for schools. Currently, there are 198 second-level schools in DEIS in Ireland. A review of the DEIS programme undertaken in 2015 identified three areas of the DEIS

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Understanding EU action on Roma inclusion (europa.eu)



Co-funded by

Views and opinions expressed are however those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or EACEA. Neither the European Union nor the granting authority can be held responsible the European Union for them.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> EU Regional Action for Roma Education - Roma Education Fund



programme as being excellent supports: Home School Community Liaison Coordinator, professional development opportunities for teachers and the position of a resource teacher <sup>7</sup>for Travellers (RTT). However, these supports continue to operate in isolation. The benefits of professional development (e.g., schemes such as First Steps, Reading Recovery) for DEIS teachers are sometimes outweighed by the challenge in sustaining these programmes and embedding them in schools when trained individual staff members leave the school.

Fleming and Harford (2022) in reviewing DEIS note "the education system as it currently stands is unfair and unequal and that the consequences of this are stark", adding that "Travellers, lone parents, people who have disabilities, who are homeless, or who are in the care of the state, asylum seekers and those who are from less affluent backgrounds are destined to struggle" (p. 450). According to Downes (2020) the current system of inequality is being legitimized through the ideologies of meritocracy, equalizing opportunity is inadequate and has not worked. Many researchers have pointed to the need to provide a tapered form of the DEIS programme to take account of those schools which fall just outside of the qualification criteria for full inclusion (Smyth, McCoy, and Kingston 2015; Fleming 2020, 2021).

Criteria to evaluate the well-being of students is acknowledged as crucial. If schools managed to maintain attendance and engagement in learning they were deemed to be successful. There is general agreement that there should be an increased focus on student's physical and emotional wellbeing particularly in relation to diversity, students who live in direct provision and students from the travelling community.

A recent report on wellbeing in the Youthreach sector (Burke, Kenny and Grummell 2022), highlights the need for 'recognition of the extended relational and support role for learners that Youthreach staff hold' (P. 14). The Youthreach Programme was introduced in 1989 as the Irish government's primary response to early school leaving and was designed to provide young people with access to education and training, progression and social inclusion (DPER, 2017; DES, 2015; Smyth et al. 2019). It aimed to address the high levels of early school leaving at the time by providing what it described as second-chance education for young people who leave second-level school before Leaving Certificate level.

Burke, Kenny and Grummell (2022) recommend that 'staff role responsibilities should take cognizance of this relational aspect and its social, psychological and learning contribution for early school learners' (p. 14). Furthermore, they highlight the need for further research across the education sector 'to understand and nurture higher levels of resilience, flourishing, relationships and engagement at an organisational and sectoral level for the benefit of staff, learners and the wider society'. Equally, they highlight that 'more suitable metrics and indicators of student success are required which take cognizant of the breadth of social, behavioural and academic development'. Development of these metrics should be developed in active collaboration with staff and learner forums (p. 15).

The findings of the Addressing Education Disadvantage Review (2017) highlighted that teacher expectations tend to be lower than warranted by independent outcome data for students from poor backgrounds. The detail of the mechanisms by which students are impacted by the expectations of their teachers, and the precise effects of such expectations, are still not well understood. There is an absence of reliable data, valid methods of measuring expectations,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The role of the resource teacher (SCOTENS)



Co-funded by the European Union

Views and opinions expressed are however those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or EACEA. Neither the European Union nor the granting authority can be held responsible for them.



and of effective strategies to raise teachers' expectations. Assisting teachers to become aware of their own prejudices and educating them about the power of their expectations for their students, might well serve to reduce the achievement gap between students from disadvantaged backgrounds and their better-off counterparts. The intersectional nature of disadvantage is also key to consider, as is the impact of locating policy attention to initiatives like DEIS rather than addressing the systemic inequalities at a societal level that leads to community experiences of socio-economic disadvantage in this way (Lynch and Baker, 2005). Burns (2016) highlights the conflicting and competing ideologies inherent in the dominance of the 'pedagogies of same', noting the balancing act required of early career teachers who are working in DEIS schools. He raises awareness of the need for debate around what is sometimes considered the 'deficit' understandings of working-class communities.

#### Traveller and Roma Policy

According to the Central Statistics Office (CSO) the number of Irish Travellers in the Census of population (2016) is 30,987 [Irish Traveller Infographic (2016)]. The Roma community in Ireland consists of persons from a range of European countries including Romania, Hungary, Slovakia, Poland and the Czech Republic (Czechia). There are no official statistics on the number of Roma in Ireland, but it is estimated to be in the region of 3,000 – 5,000. The European Commission and the Council of Europe tend to use "Roma" as an umbrella term to refer to several different groups (such as Roma, Sinti, Kale, Gypsies, Romanichels, Boyash, Ashkali, Egyptians, Yenish, Dom and Lom) and include Travellers, without denying the specificities and varieties of lifestyles and situations of these groups (p. 15).

The National Traveller Roma Inclusion Strategy (NTRIS), published in 2017 and led by the Minister for Students, Disability, Equality, Integration and Youth, provides the framework and strategic direction for interventions to improve the lives of Travellers and Roma in Ireland in practical and tangible ways. 'Recognition of the distinct heritage, culture and identity of Travellers and their special place in Irish society would be hugely important to Traveller pride, to Traveller self-esteem and to overcoming the legacy of marginalization and discrimination that the community has experienced.' (NTRIS, 2017, pp.6). The National Traveller Roma Inclusion Strategy (NTRIS) (2017-2019) identifies the principle of inclusion as the core of the Strategy and, accordingly, the focus of current education provision is on the development of a more inclusive school environment through the whole school planning process, teaching practice, admissions policies, codes of behaviour and whole school evaluation. The 'Supporting Traveller and Roma (STAR)' pilot project in education was established in 2019 under the National Traveller and Roma Inclusion Strategy (NTRIS) with the aim of improving attendance, participation and school completion in primary and secondary education in specific Traveller and Roma communities regionally.

Education-related actions include the aims of achieving equality of education outcomes, supporting an inclusive school community, and promoting a positive culture of respect and protection for the cultural identity of Travellers and Roma in education. The programme for Access to Higher Education, PATH, names Travellers as a priority group for support and the recently launched PATH 5 strand has a specific focus on supporting Traveller and Roma students to access, participate and succeed in higher education. The objectives of PATH strand 1 are to increase the number of students from underrepresented groups entering initial teacher education, and to provide more role models for students from these groups.





# 5. Initial Teacher Education and Continuous Professional Development

## 5.1. EU Wide

Teacher education issues are high on the policy agenda across Europe. The contribution that teachers can make to the development of inclusive schools and potentially to a more equitable and just society is providing the impetus for development in many countries. The reviewed literature points out that some but not all teacher training institutions are now covering the topic of teaching of students with special needs, not only as a specialist subject but also in a gradual process of change, as part of general initial training courses.

Currently the literature reviewed by the TUTOR EU wide partners suggests that European teachers do not feel that they have the required competencies regarding how to work with a culturally, linguistically, and religiously diverse student population. European teaching staff are insufficiently prepared and trained to deal with diverse classroom settings.

- There is a need to increase teacher's cultural sensitivity towards immigrant students. Stereotypical thinking about immigrant students is commonplace. The European teaching population, still largely homogeneous, does not feel well enough prepared to teach students with a different cultural and religious background (OECD, Strength through diversity: Education for Inclusive Societies, 2020)<sup>8</sup>. They lack adequate knowledge and understanding about cultural, religious and linguistic diversity and therefore feel ill prepared to work in multicultural and multilinguistic settings (OECD 2020). Providing training resources for the whole teaching staff to increase their competencies in working in a cultural-sensitive way should be included in the school policy. Research (OECD, 2020) demonstrates that teachers, certainly those working in mainstream education, need training particularly with regard to developing adequate expectations and reducing stereotypical thinking about different cultures.
- There is a need to improve teachers' capacity and competencies for managing diversity through initial teacher education programmes and continuous professional development programmes. To be able to manage diverse classrooms and schools, teachers need to be equipped with relevant knowledge, capabilities, values and skills. Proposed examples by OECD (2020) include knowledge and understanding of diversity issues, reflectivity about identities, perspectives and practices, as well as teacher agency and autonomy, empathy, and pedagogical judgement and tact. Furthermore, strong communication and listening skills, creativity and problem solving are crucial for teachers when working in diverse classrooms. Cultural anthropology, social psychology, child cognitive development, integrated learning and second language acquisition are desirable knowledge areas to be developed among teachers. Teachers would also benefit from being encouraged to develop attitudes such as curiosity, open-mindedness, awareness of others, tolerance and having high expectations for students. Training the teaching staff in dealing with diversity should be incorporated in the school policy. It is key however to provide the whole teaching staff with the necessary didactical resources and capabilities to support diverse learners.
- There is a need for teachers to be better trained and informed about LGBTQI+ issues and provide specific training in order to prevent harassment against LGBTQI+ students
  make teachers aware of the importance of the classroom climate and encourage

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> <u>https://www.oecd.org/education/strength-through-diversity/Design-and-Implementation-Plan.pdf</u>



Co-funded by the European Union Views and opinions expressed are however those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or EACEA. Neither the European Union nor the granting authority can be held responsible for them.



them to set up prevention projects with their pupils. Equip them with necessary knowledge to detect and respond appropriately to situations of harassment.

- Initial and continuous teacher education requires the reduction of prejudice, development of an equity pedagogy and field experiences to meet the increasingly diverse needs of learners in today's classrooms.
- There is a need to improve the recruitment of teacher candidates and to increase retention rates as well as increase the number of teachers from diverse backgrounds, including those with disabilities. For instance, recruiting teachers with a diverse ethnic-cultural background might have a positive influence on inclusive education of migrant/refugee learners as these teachers can provide linguistic and cultural-competency skills which boost student outcomes. The reviewed literature suggests that these teachers could act as a kind of reference person towards the target group, while at the same time retaining their professional role in school in setting educational expectations clear or putting perceptions from migrant students about differential treatments into a more realistic perspective.
- Confronting teachers with the reality and actors outside the strict framework of the school, for example, by obligatory training courses in places outside the school (homework schools, neighbourhood associations,.) so as to better understand the reality of the pupils.
- Sharing knowledge and exchanging good practices at national, regional and European level will contribute to support teachers and induce a stronger quality of inclusive education. Such collaborative initiatives aim at fostering more positive attitudes and feelings of competence in working with a culturally, ethnically, and linguistically diversified student population because they foster understanding of diversity in society and in education.
- There is a need to implement an intercultural curriculum in school. Incorporating elements of migrant cultures into school life and teaching materials increases cultural-sensitive awareness among native students and teacher (OECD, Strength Through Diversity: Education for Inclusive Societies, pp. 35)

## 5.2. Greece

## **Teacher Training in Inclusive Education**

The research conducted in this project revealed that inclusive education is mainly focused on the inclusion of students living with disabilities and there are not explicit measurements for the inclusion of LGBTQI+, migrants, and socioeconomically disadvantaged learners in school environments, supporting the design and development of training programs considering the intersectional approach as guiding concept.

According to Tzimogiannis and Komi (2004), teachers with continuous education and training through seminars and conferences feel more prepared to teach. More and more teachers are seeking training, as they believe it will help them to meet all the educational needs of their students. The role of principals in this process is crucial. By promoting inclusive education, they give space and suggest ways for teachers to act successfully in the school unit, in a climate of democracy and freedom. Teachers thus feel equal and free to plan their teaching and take initiatives to develop and improve the school.

#### **Training in Migrant Students' Inclusion**

The training of teachers in the inclusion of migrant students' is mostly not integrated in the lessons of the Teacher Education Faculties and the pedagogical training for the teaching





qualification. Teachers willing to gain more knowledge in intercultural education and migrants student's inclusion in education can attend additional courses provided by private or public educational institutions during their studies or master's degrees offered by the Greek Universities. The e-learning courses in Intercultural Education aim at training teachers for the education of refugee or migrant students with a different approach. It links the theoretical and practical framework. It focuses on enabling the teacher to reflect on the learning process by designing teaching scenarios that create usable, facilitate environments for students who do not have a good knowledge of the language. It can be informed about the religious diversity of immigrants and understanding the importance of social cohesion.

#### Training in LGBTQI+ Students' Inclusion

The teachers' education in LGBTQI+ awareness is not officially part of the teachers' initial training. In this way, there is no training in the topic as part of the mandatory teachers' training process, but there are Lifelong Learning Centers and non-governmental organizations organizing e-learning courses (such as "Gender Theories" e-learning program of the National & Kapodistrian University of Athens), seminars and activities to raise teachers' awareness and provide teachers with educational tools and methods to make their classrooms more inclusive to LGBTQI+ students and learners.

Furthermore, the LGBTQI+ organization Rainbow school, in conjunction with other Greek Organizations focusing on LGBTQI+ issues, constantly conduct seminars or activities for teachers' training and publish guidelines and lesson outlines targeted to teachers striving to foster inclusivity in education.

## 5.3. Austria

In order to significantly increase the chance that future graduates of teacher training programmes have the appropriate attitudes and competences to build step by step an inclusive school system, Feyerer recommends taking the following points into account when implementing new structures: (Feyerer, 2014, p. 180-189)

- There should be a stronger and more sustainable theoretical foundation for inclusive education in the humanities
- Create experiential spaces and opportunities for encounters in dealing with diversity
- Anchor inclusive education as an integral part of subject science/didactics and live interdisciplinary cooperation in training
- Create more school practice places with appropriate consideration of diversity
- Do not limit practical learning to teaching a class
- Promote and demand cooperation at all levels
- Give greater importance to developmentally logical didactics and thus move individualization and differentiation away from being mere buzzwords (Feyerer, 2016)

Against the background of an apparent lack of a holistic understanding of inclusion (currently it is seen primarily as the integration of pupils with disabilities and impairments), it is essential to raise awareness of the different dimensions of inclusion and the need to include all of them in all policy and practice approaches.

The risk, however, is that inclusive education is interpreted by the majority of teaching staff as merely an additive aspect to be taken care of by a few "specialists". Although "diversity" is anchored as a succinct expression in the curriculum, it is ultimately not sufficiently addressed. Those teachers who had little or no contact with the topic during their training must be given





the opportunity, in the form of further training, to be able to competently counteract the current grievances. Of course, this is not only up to the individual and idealistic attitude of the teaching staff, but should also be actively supported and pushed by the school management. Unfortunately, it has not been possible so far, both by the public body and by the individual educator, to offer or take up realistic and acceptable paths for the transformation of professional awareness and qualification.

## 5.4. Turkey

Teachers play a key role in establishing inclusive education. Both getting to know students closely and supporting their learning in line with their potential, and cooperating with other stakeholders surrounding students so that students can benefit from quality education show us the importance of teachers for inclusive education. At this point, it is necessary not to fall into the misconception that teachers are the only solely responsible for educational processes and to prevent them from being isolated. For inclusive education environments where all students feel safe and their development is supported, it is important for teachers to reflect on their work, make sense of their practices and take initiative to seek ways to improve them, as well as their pedagogical and social skills. Action Research is a method that aims to simultaneously investigate and solve an issue and would be an appropriate method to use. Regardless of the theme or need, this method can be adapted to educational processes and can enable teachers to make sense of and question their own practices and develop strategies that can be disseminated and multiplied.

In the studies in this project conducted with teachers, two teaching strategies were revealed.

## 1. Creating an environment of trust

Educational environments and learning processes need to focus on the development of social skills, alongside the academic content. All stakeholders that make up the education ecosystem are elements of the social interaction with each other, and their feeling of safety, and sense of belonging to the environment and culture they live in, affect their actions in the process. Therefore, creating a community of learners where students feel a part of, and feel valued and trusted, is essential for inclusive education. The absence of an environment of trust is an obstacle to students' participation in learning and therefore their academic development cannot be support.

## 2. Material and method diversification

For inclusive education, it is necessary to increase the participation of students in learning by responding to their various needs, as well as ensuring that students feel a sense of belonging. The way to do this is to identify and remove the barriers to students' participation in learning. For this, teachers need to get to know the students closely and learn about their strengths or areas where they need support; in addition, it needs to implement its daily practices and all the educational processes and practices it has designed, considering the inclusiveness, and transform it when needed. In order for the materials and methods used in educational processes to respond simultaneously to the needs and capabilities of all students, there is a need to act with the "universal design for learning" approach. According to this approach, information is presented to students through materials and methods appropriate to students' skills and needs; In addition, the opportunities and methods offered for students to express what they have learned and their thoughts are also increased. Thus, students can have an




experience where their abilities are met; they can continue their learning by feeling part of an inclusive culture and community.

#### 5.5. Ireland

Despite the whole of government approach and cross cutting policies on inclusion, the Irish government's policy on equality and social inclusion poses significant challenges for many schools. The pupil populations of many schools now contain large proportions of disadvantaged pupils and of ethnic minorities often in classes with high student teacher ratios. Within diverse contexts second language competencies and cultural competencies become very important.

Lack of representation of ethnic, migrant and socio disadvantaged people in the teaching profession continues to play a limiting factor. Despite interventions, it is rare for pupils from disadvantaged backgrounds to become teachers. Where advances have been made, role modelling can become problematic, particularly for those teachers who are expected to represent large cohorts of learners, and for the few representatives who are continuously drawn upon to 'give back' to society.

The UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities' (UNCRPD, 2006) states that a more robust approach to inclusivity is required. This means that if all children are to experience inclusive education, then special education must be core to provision in Initial teacher training. Further encouragement of the uptake of a post graduate qualification specialising in inclusive education, and the provision of continuing professional development for all teachers on special education, on relevant topics such as inclusive education and on Universal Design for Learning is necessary. Teachers will need to be afforded time and resources to attend such training and be facilitated to engage in practitioner networks where methodologies, methods, experiences and feedback from students can be discussed. The Education and Training Board practitioner network in Dublin, is a good example.

Numerous studies into inclusion indicate that many teachers still do not have sufficient professional competence in inclusive education, and that currently Initial Teacher Education and Continuous Professional Development neither provides them with the necessary knowledge nor covers practices and appropriate models of sustained school development (European Commission, 2013; Nairz-Wirth et al., 2012a; Nouwen et al., 2015; Nouwen et al., 2016).

A number of factors have been identified that influence the embedding of inclusive education within teaching practice. The professional competence of teachers, their expectations, attitudes and relationships, plays a key role in the prevention of exclusion. Language and cultural competencies as well as representation of diversity within the teaching profession remain key contemporary issues. Banks (2004, p. 47) highlights the need for developing teachers cultural and language diversity competencies for working with ethnic minorities and migrants.

Downes et al. (2017) referring to the Public Policy and Management Institute (PPMI) report (2013, p. 94) highlights a lack of focus on second language acquisition as a distinct competence, and language support courses are often reported by teachers to be of low quality. "It is important that not only language teachers receive training for working with immigrant children, but subject teachers as well. It is advisable for subject and specialized language teachers to work together so that teaching of academic subjects and language





happen in a coordinated way" (p. 25). "The PPMI's report notes that some countries, to increase the number of qualified specialist teachers in second language development, have introduced language courses as a subject of pre-service and in-service training" (p. 47).

However, according to McDaid and Nowlan (2021) despite an increase in ethnic diversity within the state, the Irish teaching workforce remains starkly mono-ethnic. The need for representation within the teaching profession has been highlighted. "From a nine-city study, it is evident that many municipalities in Europe have no or very few ethnic minority teachers in their schools" (Downes et al., 2017, p. 48).

In 2013, the Diversity in Initial Teacher Education (DITE) longitudinal research study was funded by the Irish Research Council. In 2017, Maynooth University launched the Turn to Teaching Initiative (TTT), the aims which are to support students from marginalized backgrounds to move into Initial Teacher Education. The Think about Teaching foundation certificate, and the two -year school outreach and CPD programme Rising Teachers Rising Leaders, both aim to promote diversity in the teaching profession through a series of social-justice orientated widening participation initiatives.

https://www.maynoothuniversity.ie/turntoteaching

A NCSE study of Newly Qualified Teachers (NQTs) experiences highlights the practice of collaborating and collective effort for meeting diverse needs, through acquiring specific skills, alongside providing consistency and continuity of support for pupils who are withdrawn from the classroom. All NQTs identified collaboration between resource <sup>9</sup>and classroom teachers as crucial. The major factors cited in relation to enabling inclusive practice are for example; support from resource/learning support staff, participation in team teaching, ways of communication, and shared time for planning opportunities (2019, p. 73). Walsh (2020) notes "Teacher collaboration is seen as central to all elements of the continuum of teacher education. At ITE, collaboration is a central principle and the ability to collaborate is an expected outcome of ITE programmes" (P. 3).

Leadership practices in the context of schools charged with including minority groups may be recognitive - fostering recognition and positive visibility of 'others' or distributive - implementation of policies, through the investment of time and resources, to support teaching and learning for diversity (Devine, 2012, p. 396).

Sider and Ling (2021) note that there is an abundance of research on the critical role of school principals in effecting positive student achievements, but not a lot in the area of principals and their role in inclusive education. They identify a gap between the literature on inclusive education and the literature on school leadership, "what is largely missing in the literature is where these two areas intersect" (p. 1).

Ryan (2006) refers to some key distinct practices to argue that inclusive school leadership involves "advocating for inclusion, educating participants, developing critical consciousness, nurturing dialogue, emphasizing student learning and classroom practice, adopting inclusive decision- and policy-making strategies, and incorporating whole school approaches" (p.9). McGhie-Richmond and Haider (pp. 32-50) consider the concept of knowledge mobilization (KM) as key to moving forward the agenda of inclusion.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> The role of the resource teacher (SCOTENS)



Co-funded by the European Union

Views and opinions expressed are however those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or EACEA. Neither the European Union nor the granting authority can be held responsible for them.



Despite the prevalence of opportunities for CPD for secondary school teachers, there is currently no national mandatory requirement for engagement by FET teachers in CPD. Even those FET teaching staff who are registered with the Teaching Council are not required to complete a minimum number of hours of CPD to maintain their registration (Dunlop, 2022, p. 14). Individual education bodies, centres and associations provide numerous CPD opportunities for teachers in schools and FET, but these are not necessarily communicated or offered systemically to teachers. From the perspective of teacher competence, a need has been identified in many countries for extended and new teacher competence to meet the challenges of inclusive education (O'Gorman and Duddy, 2011, p. 17). "A survey across 15 European countries showed that professional development is compulsory for VET leaders in only about half of the countries surveyed" (Cedefop, 2011, p.?). This resonates with the findings from TALIS that show that many VET leaders did not participate in professional development opportunities.

The PPMI report (2013, p. 47) highlights the need for the development of language competencies. The report highlights a lack of focus on second language acquisition as a distinct competence, and language support courses are often reported by teachers to be of low quality (p.94). "It is important that not only language teachers receive training for working with immigrant children, but subject teachers as well. It is advisable for subject and specialized language teachers to work together so that teaching of academic subjects and language happen in a coordinated way" (p. 47).

Challenges for teachers in implementing inclusive education include, but are not limited to, identifying the support needs of students, some of whom may be difficult to identify, and the upskilling of practitioners' competencies and skills in order to provide greater support to those students who are at risk of exclusion. In addition, developing teachers' language competencies, within ITE and CPD would support inclusive education, and greater alignment between language teachers and curriculum subject specialists in adapting to the challenges. Providing CPD and communities of learning, and support networks for others in the school community is also vital, including for school leaders, those in guidance and other support roles, managers and posts of responsibility, and developing student-led and -centered communities of practice, representation and peer networks.

#### Universal Design for Learning (UDL)

One of the ways in which teachers and the school community can be supported in implementing inclusive education is through the Universal Design for Learning (UDL) Framework. According to Padden (2017), Novak (2016) and others, Universal Design for Learning (UDL) is a framework for educators to intentionally reflect on, design or redesign learning interactions. It is a set of principles for curriculum development that give all individuals equal opportunities to learn (SOLAS, 2020b). It aims to improve the educational experience of all students by introducing more flexible methods of teaching, assessment and service provision to cater for different styles of learners. This approach is underpinned by research in the field of neuroscience and the learning sciences and is designed to improve the learning experience and outcomes for all students. There are 3 core principles underpinning UDL when designing learning experiences: educators build into their planning and delivery, multiple means of engagement, multiple means of representation and multiple means of action/expression. The first step in embracing universal design is to embrace learner diversity (Padden, 2017). Professional Learning Community (PLC), or community of practice approaches offer the potential for collective teacher efficacy in the field of inclusive education. UDL is a





principal and approach adopted within Irish education and currently being implemented, as evidenced by work of AHEAD and the UDL in FET guidance (SOLAS, 2021c).

Professional development for those in leadership positions should cover issues relating to leading, supporting and implementing change for inclusion. Differentiated levels of expertise should be embedded across the system. This should include pedagogy for active learning, collaborative planning, relational and critical pedagogies and use of relevant resources. Profession development in creative assessment and use of digital and eLearning technologies would enhance inclusive education. Specialist courses in teaching minority ethnic and minority language students, and specific modules on teaching and learning in multi-ethnic and multilingual classrooms in teacher education programmes at all levels would support an inclusive approach in education.

### 6. Key themes emerging in the Literature Review

The tentative conclusions emerging in this literature review are that despite the concept of inclusive education being on the policy agenda for many years in the countries under review the process of implementation, and the development of meaningful initiatives to support inclusive education policy within the second level school sector and within further education and training sector has been rather ad hoc, fragmented, lacks critical analysis and as a result has been limited in its scope to address inclusion through a policy level of action. This context persists, despite the goodwill and inclusive practices extended by dedicated teachers and practitioners to support the learning of all students within the classroom. Primarily, when consideration is given to the term inclusive education in the partner countries of TUTOR and elsewhere, the dominant discourse relates to how best to include students with special educational needs in mainstream educational provision. A broader definition and understanding of inclusive education are needed. To date, the narrow policy focus of inclusive education, focusing as it has on the inclusion of students with special needs, through the lens of a medical deficit model, as well as the deficit model of disadvantage remains the greatest challenge for transforming inclusive education into a holistic inclusive model that is embraced and mainstreamed across all levels in the educational systems in the countries under review.

Despite various policy initiatives and legislation acknowledging the importance of a shift towards a social justice model of inclusion, policy has tended to be hampered through fragmentation in approach, resulting in a failure to gain the wider benefits of meaningful yet isolated initiatives. The lack of critical review by policy makers and government seriously undermines what can be achieved. Overall there has been limited progress in tackling educational inequality in the TUTOR partner countries. A willingness to engage with the fundamental principles of inclusive education by all actors and allies within the education sector has been proven. The actions underpinning this willingness however are lacking in a formulated theory of change that embraces inclusion as a holistic concept, that is driven by leadership, implemented at systemic level, within a whole of government, whole of school approach.

The reasons for this are many: there exists a number of tensions identified in this literature review to be resolved, including and not limited to the dominance of competing and conflicting ideologies, not least of which is the predominance of a meritocratic approach to achievement. The targeting and labelling of learners within the current model of financially resourcing the education system to tackle inequality is highly problematic and unhelpful. This approach contributes to the tensions that exist within inclusive practice, between segregation



Co-funded by the European Union



and integration, assimilation and inculturation and between multicultural and intercultural education. Further tensions that exist within the realm of teaching practice that are yet to be resolved include those between differentiation and universality.

The literature strongly identifies the need for inclusive education to become mainstreamed into Initial Teacher Education (ITE and Continuous Professional Development (CPD within both second level and further education and training in the countries under review. It suggests that leadership, policy and practice need to coalesce and make the most of this juncture within the current policy and legislation framework of inclusion, and a systemic move towards adopting universal design for learning, which offers a methodology for the upskilling of teachers in inclusive education competencies, models, methods and practices.

This literature review has addressed the nature and the scale of the challenge of embedding inclusive education in second level, Vocational Education and Training (VET) and Further Education and Training (FET) systems in the TUTOR partner countries. It has outlined how inclusive education is evolving from a policy and strategic direction and from a research perspective. It describes the views of the stakeholders, and the main social impacts of inequality and the tensions that exist within competing and conflicting ideologies. It offers insights into the way forward, and the potential focus for teacher education.

#### 6.1. Legislation and Policy Instruments

In relation to inclusive education for secondary teachers/VET/FET teachers several gaps emerge. In reviewing the literature, the TUTOR partners noticed that limited recent studies have been undertaken on secondary/VET/FET teachers training on inclusive education. We recommend that further national research be carried out to identify the current and required knowledge, skills, competences, values, beliefs and attitudes needed by teachers to meet the diverse needs of all learners. It is crucial understanding how teachers are prepared to work with diverse groups of learners and what meanings teachers ascribe to inclusive education. More attention needs to be paid to the ways in which teachers are prepared and supported to work in inclusive settings.

#### 6.2. Definitions of Inclusive Education

Inclusive education is experienced across the partner countries primarily as education that is inclusive of students with special needs. The literature review revealed that limited attention is given to the impact of intersectionality, or of broadening the definition of inclusive education.

#### 6.3. Teachers' Feelings

Teachers across all the partner countries, EU wide, Austria, Turkey, Ireland and Greece report feeling unprepared or lacking in confidence in responding to learner diversity and learning differences. Teacher education programmes are often criticized as inadequately preparing teachers to work in schools with diverse learner groups.

#### 6.4. Teachers' Attitudes and Expectations

Trust, attitudes and expectations of teachers emerged throughout the literature reviews as playing a significant role in positive or negative outcomes for students. Teachers express lower levels of trust in students when teaching in schools with a substantial share of immigrant and socioeconomic disadvantaged students. In these types of schools, (immigrant) students may therefore have less teacher support at their disposal. The study conducted by Van Maele and Van Houtte (2011) points out that teachers collectively demonstrate lower expectations





about students' ability to meet educational expectations in schools with a higher share of immigrant students and are noticeable with respect to processes of grade orientation or retention.

## 6.5. Initial Teacher Education (ITE) & Continuous Professional Development (CPD)

Desk research across partner counties suggests that teachers feel that they do not have sufficient professional competence in inclusive education, and that currently ITE and CPD neither provides them with the necessary knowledge nor attends to practices and appropriate models of Inclusive education.

The research suggests a distinct lack of representation of ethnic, migrant and socio disadvantaged people in the teaching profession. The literature review suggests there is limited language and cultural competences amongst teaching profession across partner countries.

#### 6.6. Discrimination

Discrimination was found to exist amongst parents, teachers, and peers of each of the target groups. Discrimination, bullying and alienation is experienced by ethnic groups, Travellers, Roma, Muslim, LGBTQI+ and socio-economic disadvantaged student groups. Negative social perspective is common, along with little understanding of needs and lack of agreed definitions, terms, and semantics can be problematic and results in labelling of student cohorts.

#### 6.7. EU Wide Literature Review

The European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education noted that there are gaps between policy formulations and the actual realization of inclusive education across European countries. There appears to be deep uncertainty about how to create inclusive environments within schools and about how to teach inclusively.

According to the European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education "inclusive education is to ensure that all learners of any age are provided with meaningful, high-quality educational opportunities in their local community, alongside their friends and peers".

The European Commission's Education and Training Monitor 2015 report argues that: "Effective education is about inclusiveness, ensuring every citizen has an opportunity to develop their talents and to feel part of a shared future. Building effective education and training systems requires a focus on inclusion as part and parcel of the broader quest for excellence, quality, and relevance."

### 7. Summary

The reviewed literature regards inclusive education as a process of systematic reform embodying changes and modifications in content, teaching methods, approaches, structures, and strategies in education to overcome barriers with a vision serving to provide all students of the relevant age range with an equitable and participatory learning experience. Inclusive education is about realizing the right to an equitable high-quality education without discrimination; advancing towards more democratic and fair societies; and improving the effectiveness and efficiency of education systems.





# Section 2. Field Research on the Desired Status of Inclusive Education

The TUTOR partners in Greece, Austria, Turkey and Ireland conducted focus group discussions and interviews with 32 teachers and 32 stakeholders in education across the four countries during December 2022 and January 2023. The aims of the focus group discussions were defined during the TUTOR assessment methodology and definition of the assessment parameters. They included the following aims to guide the focus group discussions:

- to explore the context in relation to diversity within the education systems
- to explore teachers and stakeholders understanding of the concepts of inclusion and intersectionality
- to explore teaching practices for inclusive education
- training and education for inclusion in relation to Initial Teacher Education (ITE) and Continuous Professional Development (CPD)

The questions raised during the focus group discussions and interviews were designed and formulated in a collaborative process, involving all TUTOR partners.

## Part 1. Teachers' Focus Group

Overview. The following table illustrates an outline of the focus group discussions, held in December 2022 in partner countries.

TUTOR	Focus group teachers			Professions
Country	Date	Numbers	Online or in person	Mixed subject specializations
Greece	19/12/2022	5	Online-Teams	VET and school psychologist
Austria	7/12/2022	7	Online-Zoom	VET, high school, private grammar school
Turkey	12/12/2022	14	In person	5 vocational and 5 general High Schools
Ireland	1/12/2022	6	In person, Maynooth University	Second level, FET and adult education
Total	December 2022	32	2 in-person and 2 online	Mixed subject specializations

Overview of Focus Groups with Teachers

The following table outlines and summarizes the key responses from teachers regarding the desired context of diversity within schools, inclusion and intersectionality and teaching practice within each of the 4 partner countries, Greece, Austria, Turkey and Ireland.





## 1. Diversity-Desired Status

#### 1.1. Greece

Country Greece		
Focus group teachers Context-Diversity-desired status	Inclusion and Intersectionality	Teaching Practice
<ul> <li>Greater knowledge on diversity and differences is required.</li> <li>Development of intermediation support scheme in the school environment</li> <li>Regular and relevant (mandatory) teachers training in holistic inclusion</li> <li>Collaboration of school staff to create inclusive schools.</li> <li>Appropriate teaching material helpful in fostering inclusion.</li> <li>School policy to involve all teachers in relevant discourse.</li> <li>Policies that eliminate discrimination</li> <li>Topic of sexual orientation is challenging to discuss without support of educational policies, training and case studies</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Education that fosters INCLUSIVITY for ALL</li> <li>A school that embraces everyone, no matter their identity</li> <li>Students are joyful at school</li> <li>Every child accepted and treated as equal</li> <li>The term and concept of intersectionality is generally unknown</li> <li>Stereotyping can occur and is concerning.</li> <li>Each teacher takes the responsibility of acting towards the acquisition of knowledge and skills in education</li> <li>Inclusive education means that don't talk about exclusion</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Activities for exploring commonalities through group activities and mentoring</li> <li>Small group activities approach</li> <li>Activities for language learning</li> <li>Psychosocial support</li> <li>Guest specialists</li> <li>Strategy to explore students' needs</li> <li>Methodology on how to handle differences</li> <li>Knowledge and training on diversity</li> <li>Need for teaching material and help from specialists</li> <li>Demands good cooperation and active participation among school teachers, teacher councils, teacher- parent councils.</li> <li>Currently, there is a lack of teaching methods on how to promote inclusivity</li> <li>Lack of resources often causes problems</li> <li>Teachers may not be ready for discussing the gender topic.</li> </ul>





#### 1.2. Austria

#### **Country-Austria**

Focus group teachers Context-Diversity-desired status	Inclusion and Intersectionality	Teaching Practice
<ul> <li>Inclusion is a mutual acceptance and the creation of an understanding for different life situations and circumstances (keyword: disadvantage in everyday life).</li> <li>The aim should be that this results in a knowledge of valuing the other person regardless of the origin of the ethnic group, gender, sexuality and religion and supporting others in their existence.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Equality of opportunity for all student's identity characteristics</li> <li>Parity of esteem is needed for all teachers.</li> <li>Currently, there is segregation of students with special needs.</li> <li>More flexibility &amp; autonomy in language support is needed</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Teaching Practice</li> <li>Teachers acting as positive role models.</li> <li>Teaching profession more diverse</li> <li>Mutual support among teachers, collegial intervention</li> <li>Alternatives to frontal teaching in more heterogeneous classes.</li> <li>Discussing concrete cases anonymously so that one has a pool of ideas on how to deal with specific inclusion-related issues.</li> <li>Creating a framework for teachers where reflection is asked and where one is informed about recent developments, for example, how certain groups of people want to be addressed, etc. (as this also changes over time).</li> <li>More time for more individual support for students</li> <li>More financial resources</li> <li>More staff e.g. for small groups or team teaching</li> <li>Intervening immediately when discriminatory remarks are made, also setting tone</li> <li>Support awareness and flexibility in relation to diverse needs</li> <li>Tailor made programme for specific areas of development e.g. dealing with heterogeneity, anti-racism, etc.</li> </ul>





#### 1.3. Turkey

#### Country Turkey

#### Focus group teachers Context-diversity Desired status

- Teachers discussed the need for creating a safe and welcoming environment that fosters diversity and promotes respect for individual differences. They also highlighted the need for using inclusive teaching methods that are adaptable to the diverse learning needs and styles of all students.
- Teachers stated that they needed support on how to implement multicultu ral and diversity education practices, themes, materials and pedagogies.
- Teachers emphasized the importance of collaboration and partnership with families and the wider community in promoting inclusive education. They stressed the need for building strong relationships with families, and for engaging the community in efforts to promote inclusion and diversity.

- Teachers highlighted the necessity for adequate educational resources that can support inclusion.
  - They stressed the importance of providing appropriate accommodations, such as assistive technology and specialized instruction, to help students succeed in their education.
  - Turkish teachers highlighted that Inclusion requires active efforts to identify and eliminate any forms of discrimination or bias.
  - The importance of addressing negative attitudes or stereotypes that may exist toward students from marginalized or minority groups. The teachers also emphasized the need for building strong relationships with students, families, and the wider community, and for promoting a sense of belonging for all students.
  - Teachers noted the value of constant evaluation and reflection for enhancing inclusivity in the

#### **Teaching practice**

- Teachers stated that they knew the legal regulations of inclusive education practices. In their teaching practices, they only carry out inclusive education as support teachers.
- There are inclusive education practices in Special Education schools.
- They stated that curricula for immigrants and socioeconomically disadvant aged groups are not available at all school levels.
- They stated that they needed methods, techniques and training tools, especially on inclusive education.
- Teachers reported that they lack the necessary training and knowledge to effectively support students with diverse learning needs and backgrounds. They stressed the need for ongoing professional development opportunities and support from school leadership to promote inclusive practices.



Co-funded by the European Union



classroom. To foster a more diverse learning environment, they emphasized the importance of teachers constantly evaluating student achievement, adapting lessons as necessary, and reflecting on their	
teaching methods and prejudices.	

#### 1.4. Ireland

Country Ireland			
Focus group teachers Context-diversity Desired status	Inclusion and intersectionality	Teaching practice	
<ul> <li>Inclusive education is respect for difference, respect for all aspect of human beings</li> <li>Equity amongst the student community, sense of fairness</li> <li>Whole of school and school community approach</li> <li>The physical environment is very important, as is symbolism</li> <li>Silence can prevail on topics that are perceived as sensitive.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Whilst inclusion in education is an ambition, most experience the reality as different.</li> <li>Teachers' welcome initiatives to resource them and to provide tools, and access to specialists, in order to fulfil the ambition of an inclusive education system.</li> <li>There is little awareness amongst teachers of intersectionality, it is little understood, defined or acknowledged within each of the teaching contexts.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Team teaching, peer support, more than one teacher</li> <li>Discussion based pedagogy</li> <li>Small groups, organised forums/spaces</li> <li>Curriculum that represents diverse student cohorts</li> <li>Differentiation doesn't work, we are not always talking about levels of ability</li> <li>Knowing the student, dealing with issues, rather than outsourcing</li> <li>Bravery, teachers need to be brave</li> <li>Engagement, breaking down barriers</li> <li>Student centred approach, building trusted relationships</li> </ul>	





#### 1.5. Summary

Teachers' vision of diversity within educational contexts is about co-creating spaces where awareness of difference and respect for everybody in the classroom is a reality, rather than simply a policy ambition. In second level, a vision for inclusive education starts with small group discussions, and then out into the wider student cohort. Consensus was shared about the need for engagement, for breaking down of barriers, developing organized forums/spaces to talk about the issues and where teachers and students can support each other. This could work in complimentary to spaces being opened up within the curriculum for inclusive discussions. Teachers felt that a discussion-based pedagogy where ideally, everyone's opinion matters, supports inclusive education practice.

Teachers in partner countries are engaging with diverse student cohorts within various educational settings. They are mindful of the need to upskill, to effectively create spaces in education that encourage a sense of belonging and respect for all aspects of human beings. Teachers see a need for discussion amongst both peer educators and amongst peer students. Whilst inclusion in education is an ambition, most experience the reality as different, and welcome initiatives to resource them and to provide tools, and access to specialists, in order to fulfil the ambition of an inclusive education system. The concept of intersectionality was briefly touched upon, and findings suggest that there is little awareness of it, it is little understood, defined or acknowledged within each of their teaching contexts.

## 2. Initial Teacher Education (ITE) and Continuous Professional Development (CPD)

The following table outlines and summarizes the key responses from teachers in each country regarding the desired status of Initial Teacher Education and Continuous Professional Development.

2.1. Greece					
Country Greece					
Initial Teacher Education (ITE)	Continuous Professional Development (CPD)				
<ul> <li>Absence of special training regarding inclusion received by teachers in ITE</li> <li>No pedagogical training received in ITE</li> <li>Lack of teacher training on gender equality</li> <li>Obsolete teacher training</li> <li>Migrants' education should be part of ITE</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Most attendees were unaware of any training on inclusivity, have not participated</li> <li>Attendees noted that they have to look for appropriate training beyond official public structures</li> <li>Lack of training in gender equality</li> <li>Occasionally, universities implement CPD programmes for inclusion of migrant students through the Lifelong Learning Centers.</li> </ul>				



2 4



#### 2.2. Austria

#### **Country Austria**

Initial Teacher Education (ITE)	Continuous professional Development
<ul> <li>It seems to depend on the chosen combination of subjects you study whether e.g. the topic of LGBTQI+ is dealt with or not to difference it makes in everyday school life to teach rather heterogeneous classes and what methods are suitable for this</li> <li>Raising teachers' awareness of different needs and flexibility to adapt, ideally with many case studies, so that they become aware of where sore points might lie</li> <li>To learn how to encourage this sensitivity and flexibility in students as well</li> <li>Information about minority groups; inclusive conversation and regular feedback from minority groups.</li> <li>Awareness and flexibility in relation to diverse needs of students.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Create opportunities for developing mutual support among teachers, through exchange</li> <li>Create tailor made programmes for specific areas of development, e.g., dealing with heterogeneity, anti- racism etc.</li> <li>Mediation and conflict management.</li> <li>Inclusion in general</li> </ul>

#### 2.3. Turkey

Country Turkey	
Initial Teacher Education (ITE)	Continuous Professional Development (CPD)
<ul> <li>Teachers do not have educational practices related to diversity and multiculturalism in their initial teacher education.</li> <li>They stated the need for ITE programs to include greater</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Teachers said they need to participate in in-service training and continuing professional development activities on inclusive education.</li> </ul>
instruction and hands-on experience in inclusive education, covering subjects like special education, culturally sensitive teaching, and	<ul> <li>Teachers noted they need to maintain their professional development throughout their careers, and providing chances for networking, cooperation and</li> </ul>





mentoring amongst teachers is

important.

methods for supporting students with special needs.

 They suggested equipping aspiring teachers to work with varied student groups, particularly those from various social, linguistic, and cultural backgrounds.

#### 2.4. Ireland

Country Ireland				
Initial Teacher Education (ITE)	Continuous Professional Development (CPD)			
<ul> <li>Emphasis needs to be placed on inclusion in ITE and a module on inclusion is needed across all Initial Teacher Education Programmes;</li> <li>Greater understanding of the concept and impact of intersectionality</li> <li>Teachers suggested that the curriculum content, textbooks, references, images and symbolism could be revised in order to become fully representative of diversity and in order to respect all students' gender identity, cultural, ethnic and socio-economic backgrounds, abilities and life experiences</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>CPD – that is valued by governance.</li> <li>Flexible provision of CPD, timetabling is very important.</li> <li>Topics such as cultural competency and diversity in education is needed.</li> <li>Train the trainers approach</li> <li>CPD needs to include:         <ul> <li>how to recognize and respond to diversity in the classroom</li> <li>using diverse teaching methodologies and assessment modes</li> <li>diversity in curriculum material and practices</li> <li>The physical environment is noted by teachers as being extremely important, it can send out the message that everyone belongs, and there's a space for everyone to contribute their skills to the school.</li> <li>Or it can create a visual and tactile suggestion that certain abilities, genders, cultures, races/ethnicities and class systems are prioritized, celebrated and respected above others.</li> <li><i>'The things we don't see we tend to make them silent, we don't discuss them' (Irish teachers focus group, Dec 2022).</i></li> </ul> </li> </ul>			





#### 2.5. Summary

The desired status in relation to Initial Teacher Education, as highlighted by teachers across the partner countries, is for greater pedagogical support for inclusive education in its broadest sense. The absence of focus and the absence of modules on inclusive education in Initial Teacher Education is problematic. The desired status is for greater support to implement inclusive education be provided throughout the education system for teachers, in order for them to feel prepared to respond to the shifting student demographics.

The curriculum was highlighted as both a barrier and a potential enabler of greater inclusion in the focus groups. The desired status would see inclusion as a whole of school approach, where the curriculum in each country would reflect the students lived experiences, students and teachers' cultural experiences and would promote greater diversity. Teachers desired that the physical environment would reflect the diversity in the school, where the physical school environment reinforces the message of inclusion, and creates a space where everyone belongs.

Similarly, in relation to continuous professional development, teachers would like to experience greater pedagogical support for inclusive education. They desired that Institutional, systemic and school leadership would place value on continuous upskilling in relation to inclusive education. Currently teachers noted that the content of CPD does not always respond to support needs to enable greater inclusion in the classroom.

## 3. Key Themes - LGBTQI+, Migrant, Ethnic, Socio-Economic Disadvantaged Students

The following table outlines and summarizes the key responses from teachers in each country regarding the TUTOR Target groups, LGBTQI+, Migrants, Socio economic disadvantage and ethnic minorities.

3.1. Greece					
Country Greece					
LGBTQI+	Migrants	Socio economic disadvantage	Ethnic minorities, Roma & Traveller		
Teachers unaware of all genders	More opportunities exist for teacher	n/a	Roma students experience high levels of		
Not all teachers understand different	training in migrants'		discrimination		
genders	inclusion		Challenge for teachers to adapt		
Unaware of inclusion terminology	Teaching materials are more available		to regular relocation of Roma students		
Fear of approaching			students		
the students	Intersectional approach could				
Gender education is bottom of the list of inclusion in Greece	be included in education.				

#### 3.1. Greece





#### 3.2. Austria

Country Austria	Country Austria					
LGBTQI+	Migrants		Ethnic minorities,			
		disadvantage	Roma & Traveller			
We did not specifically as	sk each specific cohort	s as we felt that wou	ld have contradicted			
the inclusive spirit of the	virtual roundtable.					
All participants reported	the same issues of dis	crimination, disadvar	ntage and missing			
measures against it.						
Stakeholders described the desired state for all cohorts as						
Recognition and appreciation						
Individuality						
Flexibility and freedom						
Being close to needs and reality						
<ul> <li>Understanding, respect, tolerance, togetherness and equality</li> </ul>						
Additional comments, for someone from the LGBTQI+ community: it is sometimes difficult						

Additional comments, for someone from the LGBTQI+ community: it is sometimes difficult to be a role model because of backlash, accusations of sexualisation, etc. With regard to LGBTQI+, teachers often have no contact with it at all, and also do not have the right tools to deal with the basics. ("I often notice that many are already overwhelmed with the basics, for example, what do I do if a student comes out as trans? ")

One participant reports that he has learned from the students to address things openly and honestly (e.g., in the situation when one of his students came out).

Dilemmas associated with engaging parents, both for the parents, their potential fear of the school environment, especially if they do not speak the language, and for building trusting relationships with student, where parents might not agree with discussions about sexuality and gender identities.

External workshops for specific topics generally work well. (Examples of good workshop providers mentioned: Queerconnection, demokratieworkshops, dialog im Dunklen, Handsup,) were a good opportunity for those affected by discrimination to speak up and report their experiences, what was beneficial and what was obstructive for them. For those who have not been affected, it is possible to get a feeling for sore points in others in order to deal more sensitively with certain topics, statements, etc. and to receive suggestions for meaningful support. This is also possible with case studies. It is questionable, however, how sustainable the treatment of topics through such short interventions can be, especially since the teachers often do not continue to work on the topic afterwards and are not prepared for it. A participating social worker also suggested that many teachers felt observed or judged by such interventions and therefore did not allow workshops. People who themselves come from discriminated, marginalised groups have difficulties getting ahead in the education system and completing a teaching degree, for example, non-citizens have a hard time becoming teachers.

#### 3.3. Turkey

Focus Group Teachers-Country Turkey				
LGBTQI+	Migrants	Socio economic	Ethnic minorities,	
		disadvantage	Roma & Traveller	





Teachers stated	Migrant students were	Teachers stated	Teachers say that
that they did not	considered by teachers	that the rate of	effective diversity is
have LGBTQI+	to be integrated into	socio economically	respected in schools.
students at their	education in Turkey,	disadvantaged	
schools in	there were immigrant	students among	Turkey, which has
Turkey or	students from different	the total students	many different ethnic
that they had	countries in their	is more than 60%.	groups, has been
never met.	classrooms and they	In Turkey,	applying ethnic
	did not experience any	especially in	diversity in education
When asked	significant problems.	vocational	in harmony for many
'who should be		education, this	years.
included?	Teachers said that they	rate is 80%.	
LGBTQI+	want to communicate		Roma students did
students were	better with	Poverty including	not emerge in the
not mentioned.	immigrant students and	low income	discussions with
	they want to understand	impacts on	teachers.
Needs analysis	them better.	affordability of life	
should be		necessities,	Issues such as
undertaken.		including	hunger, poor health
		textbooks,	and social isolation
		computers,	impacts students'
		educational	ability to learn and
		materials.	succeed in school.

Who should be included in inclusive education?

The teachers, when asked the question, 'who should be included in inclusive education' do not include the LGBTQI+ group.

As can be seen from the graph below, it is seen that there is a general tendency of teachers to include students who are disadvantaged in socio-economic terms more in inclusive education.



It seems like a challenging undertaking for teachers to include LGBTQI+ students in their classes. Students that identify as LGBTQI+ in Turkey face complicated issues, including in the classroom. Lack of acceptance and understanding from their peers and teachers is one of the biggest problems for LGBTQI+ students in Turkey. Many LGBTQI+ adolescents experience isolation and lack of support at school as a result of cultural and religious standards that





frequently see LGBTQI+ identities as immoral or aberrant. Poor mental health outcomes, reduced academic achievement, and even complete school abandonment can result from this.

In Turkey, there are very few services and supports accessible for LGBTQI+ students, which adds to the difficulties they already experience. Many schools lack established LGBTQI+ support groups or organizations, and teachers may lack the knowledge and tools needed to successfully serve LGBTQI+ students. Because of this, it may be challenging for LGBTQI+ students to find the tools and assistance they need to succeed in school.

#### 3.4. Ireland

Focus Group Teachers-Country Ireland			
LGBTQI+	Migrants	Socio economic disadvantage	Ethnic minorities, Roma & Traveller

As in Austria, the Irish focus group with teachers did not ask about specific cohorts as we felt that would have contradicted the inclusive and holistic approach to the spirit of the project.

It is noted that people experiencing multiple disadvantage and exclusion are not on the same base as everyone else. Many are targeted, bullied, made fun of for difference.

Equity, access and providing a space for inclusive education is important.

Teachers said that all teachers must make an effort to include students, one such way is to be conscious of and to know how to pronounce names.

Teachers expressed a desire for greater access to information, clarity on appropriate terminology, and for specialists to attend schools to deliver workshops to enable them to implement inclusive approaches.

They reflected that in their experiences, students who are experiencing problems can tend to be outsourced, be it to external psychologists, but often what students need is just to come in and talk about an issue.

But when that support is outsourced, it can result in resources being stripped from the school and into external agencies. So, the consensus is that more in-school personnel are needed to ensure wellbeing of the general student population. Again, the conflicts inherent within the system are acknowledged

'Greater emphasis is needed on understanding intersectionality both as a concept, and consideration given to the multiple exclusions that can impact on students'

'We need so many things needed to equip us to go into that space, to deal with it.' An interesting idea developed around exclusion as a process that permeates, and is more forceful, and creates more lasting impacts than any initiatives that are intended to counteract that feeling of exclusion.

'Through the system you've learned to be excluded. So, you've learned to exclude yourself, you're very good at it'

At this point the need for time in the timetable that can be allocated to small group discussions about inclusion, is necessary. In order to do that extra teachers and extra guidance counsellors are needed. Rather than bringing in an external psychotherapist or external agency to deal with issues arising, on an irregular basis. Integrating support for students into the daily life of the school and resourcing teachers with the time to do it. 'Teachers must get to know and understand the students, that starts with learning how to pronounce students' names'





'Whether you're a minority group or whatever, you're not at the same base as everybody else. It is about providing a system of equity and how you're accessing that and providing that space for them'.

However, the current trend in education, based as it is on the practice of differentiation and on streaming of classes, placing students into classes based upon academic ability, can disadvantage migrants.

'Sometimes migrants, ethnic minorities are streamed into classes that have lower expectations'

The general approach to differentiation was discussed, and teachers concluded that in the interests of inclusive education, meaning inclusion for all, that

'Differentiation doesn't work-we are not talking about levels of ability here, possibly with language supports its needed, but there are other differences that cannot be addressed with differentiation'

Creating spaces for intercultural activities to take place on the school calendar is useful in terms of understanding and including students from all backgrounds, acknowledging and respecting differences in terms of culture, food, religion all plays a part in creating a more inclusive school community. Inviting students' families into the school environment, to learn from each other's cultures has been a positive experience in opening up discussions. 'Also, the need for parents to support inclusion, so that it comes from the home, from the roots, it needs to come from the ground up, the message that difference is ok.'

The issue of representation of diversity within the teaching profession was noted. *'Teachers should be representative of their students'*. There remains a lot to do to change levels of representation, particularly of migrants and ethnic minorities across the education system. Representation of parents at Board of Management and parent association forums is also important to reinforce the message that inclusion of all is welcome.

#### 3.5. Summary

Experiences that were common across partner countries include

- legislation, policies and strategies are in place across the countries; however, they vary in terms of being known by and being accessible to teachers.
- Poor implementation, resourcing and monitoring of policies, strategies and legislation.
- There exist multiple layers of discrimination towards students who belong to LGBTQI+, migrant, ethnic minorities and socio economically disadvantaged communities.
- Widespread exclusions occur at macro and micro level.
- Teachers are challenged to respond to rapidly shifting margins.

Within the teaching profession, the following issues have been highlighted

- Lack of representation of migrants, ethnic minorities, socio-economically disadvantaged and LGBTQI+ people in teaching profession.
- Limited language and cultural competencies of teachers.
- Lack of agreed definitions, semantics can be problematic.
- Trust, attitudes, respect and expectations of teachers is very important.
- Teachers highlight that do not have sufficient professional training or competence in inclusive education.





## Part 2. Stakeholders' Focus Group or Interviews

#### Overview: Inclusive Education, Intersectionality

The following section describes and outlines the open consultation process with stakeholders in education in Greece, Austria, Turkey and Ireland. 32 stakeholders in education participated in the focus group discussions and or interviews during December 2022 and January 2023 across the four countries.

**Stakeholders' definition**: Stakeholders, in this instance, are those who represent the interests of others involved in education such as: education managers, planners, policy makers, public administrators, education statutory agency and ministries' officials. Stakeholders also include ITE coordinators, CPD planners, principals, psychologists, and coordinators in second level and VET/FET, representatives of wider school community partners, representative groups or networks on LGBTQI+, migration and socio-economic disadvantaged communities. This also includes EU Level national networks for partners who are focusing their efforts at EU level.

TUTOR	Focus Group/Interview	Numbers	Stakeholders	Professions
Country	Date		Online/in person	Mixed subject specialisations
Greece	27/01/2023	3	Online	VET and school psychologist
Austria	7/12/2022	3	Online, Microsoft teams	VET, high school, private grammar school
Turkey	17/01/2023	20 school principals from 20 high school- level schools	In person	District governor, County Vice President, District Office Directors, District NGO representatives, Provincial National Education Governor, District directors of national education,
Ireland	1/12/2022	6	In person, Maynooth University	Second level, FET, adult and community education
Total	Dec '22-Jan '23	32	2 online, 2 in-person	30 professionals-Mixed subject specialisations

	older Focus Key findings	Conclusio	ons	Recommendations	
Country	/ Greece				
1.1.	Greece				
Reco	ommendations	S			
1. Stak	eholders'	Кеу	Findings,	Conclusions	and





- Teachers should have a clearer comprehension of their role and responsibility.
- Need of practical support from the ministry of education
- Migrant students are usually part of Zones of Educational Priority
- Training needed on how to deal with specific target groups in terms of inclusion.
- Creation of Teachers Networks and Associations

- Inclusion is aligned with inclusion of students with special needs.
- Training material is obsolete.
- ITE and CPD doesn't change easily and doesn't correspond to the societal changes.
- Inclusion is considered as a separate lesson that should be an extra hour

- Update of existing policies, legislation and directives on diversity and inclusivity
- Creation of a holistic inclusivity training for teachers
- Glossary on how to use inclusive language

#### 1.2. Austria

Country Austria		
Stakeholder Focus Groups Key findings	Conclusions	Recommendations
<ul> <li>Inclusion must be explicitly defined as a common goal and strived for the realization of equal educational opportunities.</li> <li>Exclusion of exclusion</li> <li>The living of diversity as normality</li> <li>Practical and implementable expert guidance at all levels of education</li> <li>Make plurality visible, through teachers as role models of lived diversity in terms of age, ability, ethnicity, sexuality and gender</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Although inclusion has already been formulated as a political goal, however, the processes towards this goal would have to be accelerated.</li> <li>Action- and practice- oriented teaching, close to reality e.g. working with case studies</li> <li>Providing stimulus for reflection</li> <li>Guidance on collegial intervision</li> <li>How pedagogues can act as role models and set a positive example</li> <li>Using personal narratives/stories to connect with students</li> <li>Cross-curricular and cross-thematic teaching</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Conflict management and mediation training</li> <li>Individual schools could make more use of the space for autonomy they have been given.</li> <li>School management should organise more exchange opportunities with staff and colleagues.</li> <li>Information on individual minorities, e.g. on the special situation of the Roma, who have been affected by centuries of discrimination and persistent prejudice structures - but in particular also by the Holocaust, in which, for example, about 90% of Burgenland's Roma were murdered</li> </ul>





<ul> <li>Creating safe spaces where everyone feels welcome</li> <li>Including and understanding students' lifeworld</li> <li>Strengthen self- esteem and self confidence</li> <li>Responding to the needs of individuals and accepting failure, retrying and individual support as part of the norm.</li> <li>With more forms of social learning ocordination between the various subject teachers are required.</li> <li>Getting to know systemic approaches</li> <li>Designing lifeworld and action-oriented practical lessons</li> <li>The role of teachers as coaches or advisors who do not present ready- made solutions but accompany the individual learning process in a resource-oriented way.</li> <li>Possibilities of prioritizing the learning content of the curriculum</li> <li>Burn Out Prevention</li> </ul>

## 1.3. Turkey

Country Turkey		
Stakeholder Focus Groups Key findings	Conclusions	Recommendations
<ul> <li>There is legal legislation on inclusive education in Turkey, but reliable data is difficult to find.</li> <li>The importance of frameworks for inclusive education in Turkey.</li> <li>Frameworks are crucial for promoting equal opportunities in education and for building a more equitable and just society.</li> <li>Parents, communities, and civil society organizations should be involved in the development and implementation of these frameworks</li> <li>An inclusive education system can help address the challenges of inequality and social exclusion that exist in the accurter.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Although the legislation exists, there is a need to improve the professional competence of school administrators and teachers.</li> <li>Discrimination against certain groups, such as refugees, women, and students from low-income families is still prevalent in Turkey's education system.</li> <li>Students facing this type of prejudice are unlikely to perform well academically or go on to access higher education courses.</li> <li>The Turkish</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Comprehensive and well- structured training programs, which should be supported by government policies.</li> <li>Teacher training programs should not just focus on subject content but also include pedagogical strategies that encourage critical thinking, active learning, and problem-solving skills among students.</li> <li>Importance of ongoing professional development to ensure teachers stay up to date with new teaching methods, technological advancements, and changing curriculums.</li> <li>Needs analysis should be undertaken.</li> <li>Stakeholders indicated the need for</li> </ul>
the country	government has	



Co-funded by the European Union



- Immigrant students have increased in recent years.
- Many students from different ethnic groups.
- There are challenges in creating a sense of belonging for LGBTQI+ students.

attempted to tackle the problem by introducing policies aimed at promoting equality in school settings, including affirmative action programs, but many believe that more needs to be done to ensure that all students have access to a high-quality education regardless of their background. inter-institutional cooperation.

 There is a great need to include inclusive education in university teacher training programs.

1.4.	Ire	land
<b>1</b> . <b>T</b> .		iunu

Country Ireland		
Stakeholder Focus Groups Key findings	Conclusions	Recommendations
<ul> <li>Gap between inclusion at policy level, students' needs &amp; what happens in practice</li> <li>Identifying the pressures on teachers and need for capacity-building, and providing supports.</li> <li>Teacher shortage &amp; precarity in their employment contracts</li> <li>Growing diversity of student population &amp; pressures on teachers</li> <li>Lack of diversity in curriculum</li> <li>Impact of systemic neglect of students and systemic barriers</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Sense of intersectionality was described in practical and responsive ways in terms of the impact on the school's practice and classrooms within the context of rapidly changing demographics.</li> <li>Diverse capacity and needs amongst the student population is growing exponentially and quickly.</li> <li>Discrimination is prevailing</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Need to develop and provide curriculum content, and material for training, in order to build the confidence of teachers on the issues of inclusive education.</li> <li>Inclusive Frameworks (UDL, active learning, interculturalism etc.) BUT clash with rigidity of system, especially assessment requirements</li> <li>Tackle discrimination – direct experiences of Travellers, Roma etc.</li> <li>Indirect cultural &amp; systemic discrimination.</li> </ul>





# 2. Stakeholders' Conclusions and Recommendations: Inclusive Education

#### 2.1. Greece

The representation of ALL is an emphasis of the inclusive school. Everyone feels included and special. Although each person's traits make a difference, they are not the object of discrimination. Policies and laws supporting the inclusion of students with diverse needs are lacking in Greek education. Regarding the intended state of inclusive education, teachers should participate in a teacher training program on inclusion in education as part of their initial and ongoing professional development as educators. The improvement of current learning environments can support the growth of a more inclusive society by playing a catalytic role in the changing of students' perspective and thinking. The standards of inclusive education can be created through an alternate but crucial strategy, such as an inclusive training program that gives instructors the knowledge, instructions, and resources they need to accept and actively implement measures encouraging inclusive education.

There are several ways to promote inclusion in education. First and foremost, it is crucial to increase teachers' knowledge of their obligations as "mediators" of inclusion. Additionally, by providing educators with the infrastructure and resources they require, key stakeholders who work in regional educational offices, municipalities, and the government can help them develop inclusive classrooms by arming them with the most crucial knowledge, skills, competences, and tools. Continuous teacher training in inclusivity, the creation of a mentoring program for teachers, and collaboration between teacher associations and institutions with knowledge in various facets of inclusivity can change how the public views the subject of inclusive education and motivate a wide range of stakeholders to act.

#### 2.2. Austria

Ways towards an inclusive status in education were described as follows, through the accompaniment of an everyday school life process of reflection on and sensitive handling of diversity (related to gender, sexual orientation, age, ethnic origin and nationality, religion and belief, disability, social origin, etc.), which is initiated with suitable methods that inspire enthusiasm for the topic, the question "What does this have to do with me?" This would create a sense of responsibility. In doing so, teachers should especially consider differences in social origin, different life circumstances, disadvantages, developmental phases/maturity levels of the pupils, as well as promote exchange, acceptance, appreciation of other experiences as enrichment, change of perspective and understanding.

Stakeholders point to three interdependent levels/systems:

- I. personal level/person-teacher system (question of attitude, if necessary change one's own view see inclusion as an opportunity).
- II. school system (totality of all offers here, as described, changes are necessary)
- III. the education policy system.

There is a need for practical and implementable tips and inputs from experts at all levels, who have know-how through theory (studies, courses, ...) and practice (experience!!).

Inclusion as "optimized and extended integration" is a developmental step forward in the education system and would not least also counteract problems in society as a whole in the longer term, in particular by strengthening supportive social structures and by learners and





teachers experiencing that "every voice counts", i.e., valuable and positively connoted experiences of democracy are made.

It would be important that all colleagues in an institution are sensitized to the topic initiated and actively supported by the management level - especially when dealing with colleagues who tend to distance themselves from these topics. Inclusion must be explicitly defined as a common goal and strived for. Plurality would also be made visible through diversity in the teaching staff. This also includes paying attention to language, explicitly emphasizing an appropriate choice of language and enforcing this in the school staff, because language creates awareness.

The involvement of parents (guardians) and families of pupils seems to be a difficult topic for the participants. On the one hand, it is enriching and beneficial when both parents and teachers pull together, on the other hand, the exchange with parents can also be quite delicate, and they would rather try to work things out with the pupils themselves. The following aspects were expressed as obstacles. The institution of school is sometimes frightening for some parents who do not speak the language themselves. Parents sometimes seemed just as helpless, would not draw any consequences from the child's difficulties or with the child and would rather transfer responsibility to the teachers.

Some of the students tell them that LGBTQI+ issues are a sensitive topic at home. Parents complained "...because they didn't want their students to come into contact with such thinking and felt that their students would be "sexualized" by it and convinced of this "ideology"."

Teachers reported that sometimes it was worrying that invited parents might then sanction the child in question severely. It is difficult to find the right balance in a conflict of loyalty between the pupil and parents, to maintain the basis of trust with the pupil and to take on an anchor function.

#### 2.3. Turkey

When policymakers, decision-makers, and teachers collaborate to achieve a shared objective related to inclusive education, inclusivity in education is implemented. The questions that arise are whether teachers understand their roles as professionals and responsible citizens and receive institutional support from the ministry of education, the public authorities, and the regional offices for secondary education. Schools and educators should have all the support they need to create an educational environment that equally includes all people, regardless of their external characteristics, sexual identities, origins, socioeconomic status, and cultural background.

This situation reveals the need for teachers working at the high school level to improve themselves in diversity. It has been observed that school principals and decision-makers do not have enough experience in what kind of responsibility they should take on diversity education. Stakeholders cannot obtain reliable data on the lack of legal legislation especially on LGBTQI+, and the awareness of these student groups.

- It has been observed that we have a group of education workers who care about differences and diversity.
- It has been observed that there are needs, especially in terms of educational methodologies.





- Teachers state that they are not adequately supported by school administrations regarding the educational environment.
- It is understood that there is not enough curriculum about diversity and methods in teacher education faculties.
- Teachers are seen as willing to participate in the training programs to be carried out.
- It has been observed that decision-makers need more clearly defined responsibility issues.

As a result of our focus group meetings with teachers and stakeholders, we have analyzed the data and concluded the issue of inclusive education in Turkey. After careful consideration of the data, we have determined that there is a significant need for increased awareness and training for teachers regarding inclusive education. Many teachers expressed a lack of knowledge and resources in this area, and we recommend that training programs should be implemented to address this issue.

The stakeholders have expressed concerns about the issue of educational discrimination, both in terms of access and quality. Discrimination against certain groups, such as refugees, women, and students from low-income families is still prevalent in Turkey's education system. Such discriminatory practices hinder students' academic progress and career prospects and can create a sense of marginalization and exclusion. Many argue that students facing this type of prejudice are unlikely to perform well academically or go on to access higher education courses. The Turkish government has attempted to tackle the problem by introducing policies aimed at promoting equality in school settings, including affirmative action programs, but many believe that more needs to be done to ensure that all students have access to a highquality education regardless of their background.

#### 2.4. Ireland

Participants were involved in different areas of education, with expertise in national policy and provision for sustainability in education; disability and special education needs, socioeconomic disadvantage and education; LGBTQI+; migrants and Travellers. Their roles varied across different types of regional programme delivery, staff development and students support on a local and regional level across Ireland. Stakeholders recognized.

'a real want for content, for material, for training, so that teachers and tutors are more confident in the day, able to tackle some of the issues that are just going to be coming up in their classrooms all the time.'

Their sense of intersectionality was described in practical and responsive ways in terms of the impact on the school's practice and classrooms as

'We have more global perspectives coming into classrooms... So, it's if it's a war going on in Ukraine, a lot of the people might actually be more refugees right now. And so, the teachers are trying their best. They need to work with what's going on in the classrooms.'

Their vision of diversity was discussed in terms of the diverse capacities and needs of students which are evident in contemporary classrooms, with a sense of this diversity growing exponentially and much quicker than is reflected in the teaching profession. They spoke of diversity in education as being 'able to facilitate people from with all different academic abilities, to be able to facilitate anybody that has any physical needs... students from the LGBT community'.





Stakeholders acknowledged that the wide range of different backgrounds and communities of students, with the schooling system 'trying to be able to facilitate them in some way.' In terms of inclusive education, they defined it broadly as covering a range of different issues, usually focusing on how teachers can support students. For example, defining inclusive education in terms of how it engages teachers more about how they're being able to interact with their students and dealing with global citizenship issues and topics. So, it does cover things like LGBTQI+ + issues, inclusivity, accessibility, and religious, ethnic and racial majorities or minorities, depending on communities. While there were no specific references to intersectionality as a topic by stakeholders, they discussed the overlapping needs of specific groups of students in terms of gender, disability, socio-economic background, migrant status.

## 3. Training Programs - Initial Teacher Education (ITE) & Continuous Professional Development

#### 3.1. Greece

Intercultural education classes that emphasize rights, the foundations of inclusive communities, and the essential components of students with disabilities or special needs in education and training are a common feature of initial teacher training programs. Yet, inclusive education does not take a holistic approach.

Initial teacher training programs do not include how to manage a mixed classroom that aims to include all students in one classroom without classifying them into groups based on their financial level, gender identity, or cultural background. The instructors who graduated from institutions not directly related to the teaching profession have never attended a teaching program, and in-service teachers are not required to complete training for integrating students into the mainstream of education.

The lack of teacher education programmes leads to a lack of teacher preparation, the use of teaching methods that don't meet the diverse needs of students, and official training materials that don't give them the support they need for inclusive teaching methodologies and materials. Additionally, the fixed mindset in teaching processes may have an impact on the degree of inclusivity in the classrooms.

Teachers' own effort in creating a draft framework containing teaching strategies and practices that could aid them in incorporating students with special needs is a useful practice towards the development of a holistic inclusivity approach to learning. This idea came about as a result of teachers participating in a prototype educational training program while undergoing initial teacher training. In this situation, the concept of inclusivity was tackled from the standpoint of teachers' individual accountability for determining the instructional strategies that will increase inclusion and decrease exclusion.

To enable instructors to change the current educational environments, inclusive education should be at the core of the teacher's curriculum and should be accompanied by contemporary components. The future of inclusive education may lie in cooperative teaching, which promotes teamwork and participation in the teaching and learning process.

The benefits of co-facilitation were at the forefront of the discussions and were highly regarded by the participants. Many secondary school teachers, especially those who come from diverse fields and aren't directly related to teaching-based university departments and professions, lack the most crucial knowledge for implementing co-facilitation in learning and





the essentials of alternative educational approaches. The development of support networks for teachers is a significant step in the ongoing development of teachers' abilities.

The stakeholders emphasized that lifelong learning is a crucial component of teachers' continuing professional development adding important themes and elements to their existing knowledge that would help them become inclusive teachers. In order for teachers to evaluate their prior knowledge, abilities, and competences as well as try, implement, review, and reassess newly acquired knowledge, an effective teacher training program on inclusive education themes should mix theory and practice. Also, determining the regional level needs for teacher training in order to enable educators to design individualized and tailored learning experiences. CPD in inclusive education will assist in reflective practice, recognizing own prejudices and obstacles to providing inclusive education as well as in doing a self-evaluation process.

#### 3.2. Austria

With regard to the desired status of teacher education, the consulted persons were asked "Which pedagogical approaches and curricula would be most effective for inclusive education?" There recommendations are:

- Raising awareness of diversity and inclusion and, in addition to subject didactics and the like, preparation for social issues and conflicts.
- Information on individual minorities, e.g., on the special situation of the Roma, who have been affected by centuries of discrimination and persistent prejudice structures
   but in particular also by the Holocaust, in which, for example, about 90% of Burgenland's Roma were murdered
- Getting to know systemic approaches.
- Designing lifeworld and action-oriented practical lessons
- Teaching the role of teachers as coaches or advisors who do not present ready-made solutions but accompany the individual learning process in a resource-oriented way.

The interviewees pointed out the following recommendations and guidance related to inclusive education.

 IMST-Gender Netzwerk (2012): Inklusion – Eine gemeinsame Schule f
ür alle, https://www.imst.ac.at/app/webroot/files/GD-Handroichungon/handroichung\_inklusion\_11\_2012.ndf

Handreichungen/handreichung\_inklusion\_11-2012.pdf

UNESCO (2009): Policy Guidelines on Inclusion in Education. (comment of the authors: Even if more than a decade old, there is an inspiring statement in the paper: "The major impetus for inclusive education was given at the World Conference on Special Needs Education: Access and Quality, held in Salamanca, Spain, June 1994. More than 300 participants representing *92 governments and 25 international organizations considered the fundamental policy shifts required to promote the approach of inclusive education, thereby enabling schools to serve all students, particularly those with special educational needs. Although the immediate focus of the Salamanca Conference was on special needs education, its conclusion was that: 'Special needs education – an issue of equal concern to countries of the North and of the South – cannot advance in isolation. It has to form part of an overall educational strategy and, indeed, of new social and economic policies. It calls for major reform of the ordinary school'.", (p. 8), and a meaningful figure: figure 4: Education through the inclusion lens (p. 15),: "... seeing education through the inclusion lens implies a shift from seeing* 





the child as a problem to seeing the education system as the problem that can be solved through inclusive approaches", and "It (comm. Inclusion) often involves developing alternative and non-formal dimensions of learning within a holistic education system in order to promote inclusion at all levels." (p. 16.)

Although inclusion has already been formulated as a political goal, however, the processes towards this goal would have to be accelerated. Structures for learning in a heterogeneous group should be promoted and a move away from (performance) grouping according to arbitrary categories such as age, origin, first language, grading, disability, gender, etc. should be realised.

Secured funding for educational institutions and projects would make it possible to care for learners more individually, for example, to teach in team-teaching and to better adapt teaching to interests, talents and needs without having to give in to the pressure to perform through curriculum and performance requirements, but more psychological and social work support services would also have to be created. In this context, the meaningfulness of the current performance assessment with the school grading system should also be questioned. If school grades are to be used, then there should also be assessments outside of the subject assessment, for example through behavioural grades or for social competences.

Digital inclusion also would open up broader and often fairer access to educational measures, regardless of place of residence, mobility and financing options. At the same time, however, it would also mandate action on the part of educational institutions to support people in acquiring and developing digital literacy. This would apply to both, learners and teachers.

By networking with multipliers and experts from the fields of social and educational counselling one should reach those people who have failed according to the standards of the "conventional" education system.

To set such targets as a standard and achieve them, educational institutions and school administrations should lobby intensively for,

- The creation of additional support services, e.g. for language support courses in the afternoon, or funding for workshops on diversity, inclusion, human rights, principles of the constitution and personal rights of each individual;
- providing teachers with more time for social issues and exchange among colleagues, or (more) social workers, also for the involvement of parents, so that the core of the teachers' educational mission does not fall by the wayside;
- to set financial incentives and increase remuneration;

#### 3.3. Turkey

Recommendations:

- Teacher training programs should be developed to provide teachers with the knowledge and skills necessary to effectively implement inclusive education practices in their classrooms.
- Additional resources, such as funding and materials, should be made available to support inclusive education efforts in Turkish schools.
- Awareness campaigns should be launched to promote understanding and acceptance of marginalized groups among the broader community, including parents, students, and educators





The stakeholders have provided valuable feedback regarding training programs such as ITE (Initial Teacher Education) and CPD (Continuing Professional Development). They recognize the importance of these programs in enhancing the quality of education and improving teaching practices. Stakeholders highlight the need for comprehensive and well-structured training programs, which should be supported by government policies. They suggest that teacher training programs should not just focus on subject content but also include pedagogical strategies that encourage critical thinking, active learning, and problem-solving skills among students. Additionally, some stakeholders emphasized the importance of ongoing professional development to ensure teachers stay up-to-date with new teaching methods, technological advancements, and changing curriculums. Overall, Turkish stakeholders acknowledge the vital role that training programs play in building a strong foundation for future generations and endorse initiatives that enhance teacher competence and capacity to deliver quality education.

#### 3.4. Ireland

While extensive policies existing in the Irish context regarding equality and inclusion in education (which are documented in the transnational literature review report), participants noted the gap between the principles of inclusive policies and the reality of practice on the ground. This was particularly pertinent in relation to teachers' capacities to support student needs, both in terms of a general feeling of not being prepared and the identification of a clear need for teacher CPD. As a consequence, they felt a lot of support and advocacy work fell to the family members of students who were "incredible in terms of championing [students'] rights...[they] go and do the research, and then brings it to [the school] and then has to push for it. And I don't think there's any bad will or malice. But there is a lack of understanding or maybe long-term perspective [on the part of teachers]."

The contract position of some teachers was noted as an area of concern at a national level, with those working in the area of VET often being on hourly precarious contracts and poor conditions. They described how VET teachers are "not guarantee the permanent role or you're not guaranteed enough hours... [staff] might to move around and that doesn't suit a lot of people. They don't want that. They want the security of just go and work it there...You have to be a certain type of person to fit into the system at the moment, and it's driving a lot of good people who otherwise would have come into it and might be amazing educators."

They also identified the cost of living and teachers being unable to afford accommodation and the cost of living if they are teaching in urban or suburban areas with an accommodation crisis. This is combined with a shortage of teachers across the board in Ireland and a lack of representation of diversity and inclusion amongst the teaching profession to reflect the diverse demographics of students

#### 3.5. Conclusions

The literature review in section 1 concludes that inclusive education is the desired status, and that various mechanisms of legislation, strategic and policy instruments exist at national level, at EU level and internationally to support this aspiration across the TUTOR partner countries. However, gaps exist in the implementation of inclusive education. Gaps exist both in the implementation of legislation and policy and in the resourcing of teachers and stakeholders, at varying levels at TUTOR national level, to support inclusive education. The outcome for teachers, students and stakeholders in education is that inclusion is applied at an ad hoc level, by teachers who are agentic and committed to inclusion at a personal level. Currently





implementation and practice of inclusive education is less than robust across the second level education systems in the TUTOR partner countries.

In section 2, similarities and commonalities are highlighted across the TUTOR partner countries in both the teachers and the stakeholders' reflections and interpretations of the desired status of inclusive education. Whilst differences in policy and implementation are obvious at national level, nevertheless, the overwhelming message from teachers and stakeholders is for greater support to enable them to respond adequately and in a holistic, humane and creative way to the rapidly changing student demographics.





### 4. References

#### 4.1. EU Wide

Ávila Rodríguez, Rubén (2021). LGBTQI+ *Inclusive Education Study*. Brussels: IGLYO. (Accessed: 2022)

Bešić, E. (2020) 'Intersectionality: A pathway towards inclusive education?' *Prospects, 49,* 111–122. Available at <u>https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11125-020-09461-6</u> (Accessed: 2022)

Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights. (2017) *Fighting school segregation in Europe through inclusive education: a position paper*. Strasbourg: Council of Europe. Available at <u>https://rm.coe.int/fighting-school-segregation-in-europe-throughinclusive-education-a-pos/168073fb65</u> (Accessed: 2022)

Council of Europe. (2018) *Study on inclusive education in Europe and in the Republic of Moldova: Reasonable accommodation, access to education and non-discrimination*. (Ast, F, eds) Available at <u>https://rm.coe.int/study-on-inclusive-%C2%ADeducation/1680932033</u> (Accessed: 2022)

Council Recommendation of 22 May. (2018) *On key competences for lifelong learning*. Official Journal of the European Union. Available at <u>https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:32018H0604(01)&rid=7</u>(Accessed: 2022)

European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education. (2011) *Teacher Education for Inclusion across Europe*. (Donnelly, V., Watkins, A, eds). Denmark: European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education. Available at <u>https://www.cairn.info/revue-la-nouvelle-revue-de-l-adaptation-et-de-la-scolarisation-2011-3-page-17.ht</u> (Accessed: 2022)

European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education (2014a) *Inclusive education in Europe: Putting theory into practice*. International Conference, 18 November 2013. Reflections from researchers. Odense Denmark: European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education. Available at: <u>https://www.european-agency.org/sites/default/files/IC%20Researchers%20paper.pdf</u> (Accessed: 2022)

European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education. (2015) Agency Position on Inclusive Education Systems. Denmark: European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education. Available at <a href="https://www.european-agency.org/sites/default/files/PositionPaper-EN.pdf">https://www.european-agency.org/sites/default/files/PositionPaper-EN.pdf</a> (Accessed: 2022)

European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education. (2021) *Key Principles Supporting policy development and implementation for inclusive education*. Available at <a href="https://www.european-">https://www.european-</a>

agency.org/sites/default/files/Key%20Principles%20%E2%80%93%20Supporting%20policy% 20development%20and%20implementation%20for%20inclusive%20education\_1.pdf (Accessed: 2022)

European Commission. (2015) *Education and Training Monitor 2015*. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union. Available at

https://op.europa.eu/en/publication-detail/-/publication/07bfe0f8-8e88-11e5-b8b7-01aa75ed71a1 (Accessed: 2022)





European Commission. (2018) Education *and Training Monitor 2018*. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union.

https://education.ec.europa.eu/sites/default/files/document-library-docs/volume-1-2018education-and-training-monitor-country-analysis.pdf (Accessed: 2022)

European Commission. (2020) Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions: EU Anti-racism Action Plan 2020-2025. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union. Available at <u>https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-</u> content/EN/TXT/?uri=COM%3A2020%3A0565%3AFIN (Accessed: 2022)

European Commission. (2020) Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions: EU Action Plan on Integration and Inclusion 2021-2027. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union. Available at <u>https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legalcontent/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX:52020DC0758</u> (Accessed: 2022)

European Commission. (2021) *Inclusive Education*. Available at: <u>https://education.ec.europa.eu/focus-topics/improving-quality/inclusive-education</u> (Accessed: 2022)

European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. (2016) *Education: the situation of Roma in 11 EU Member States*. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union. Available at : <u>https://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra\_uploads/fra-2014-roma-survey-dif-education-</u> <u>1\_en.pdf</u> (Accessed: 2022)

European Union. (2018) Council Recommendation on promoting common values, inclusive education, and the European dimension of teaching. Official Journal of the European Union. Available at <a href="https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX%3A32018H0607%2801%29">https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX%3A32018H0607%2801%29</a> (Accessed: 2022)

European Union. (2020) *Council Recommendation On vocational education and training (VET) for sustainable competitiveness, social fairness and resilience*. Official Journal of the European Union. Available at <u>https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-</u> <u>content/EN/TXT/?uri=CELEX%3A32020H1202%2801%29</u> (Accessed: 2022)

Florian, L., Camedda, D. (2020) 'Enhancing teacher education for inclusion', *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 43(1), 4-8. Available at <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2020.1707579">https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2020.1707579</a> (Accessed: 2022)

Haug P. (2017) 'Understanding inclusive education: ideals and reality', *Scandinavian Journal of Disability Research*, 19(3), 206-217. Available at <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/15017419.2016.1224778">https://doi.org/10.1080/15017419.2016.1224778</a> (Accessed: 2022)

Kemper, R. et al. (2020) 'Separating newcomers: pragmatism or ideology? Schools' responses to newly arrived migrants in Flanders', International *Journal of Inclusive Education*, 1-20. Available at <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2020.171153</u> (Accessed: 2022)





OECD. (2019) The Lives of Teachers in Diverse Classrooms. OECD Education Working Paper No. 198 Available at <u>https://www.oecd.org/officialdocuments/publicdisplaydocumentpdf/?cote=EDU/WKP(2019</u>)6&docLanguage=En (Accessed: 2022)

OECD. (2020) *Strength through Diversity: Education for Inclusive Societies*. Paris : OECD Available at <u>https://www.oecd.org/education/strength-through-diversity/Design-and-Implementation-Plan.pdf</u> (Accessed: 2022)

Ramberg, J., Watkins, A. (2020) 'Exploring inclusive education across Europe: some insights from the European Agency statistics on inclusive education', *Forum for International Research in Education*, 6 (1), 85-101. Available at

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/338504387\_Exploring\_Inclusive\_Education\_acro ss\_Europe\_Some\_insights\_from\_the\_European\_Agency\_Statistics\_on\_Inclusive\_Education (Accessed: 2022)

Stepaniuk, I. (2018) 'Inclusive education in Eastern European countries: a current state and future directions', *International Journal of Inclusive Education*. Available at <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2018.143018">https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2018.143018</a> (Accessed: 2022)

UNESCO (2009) Policy Guidelines on Inclusion in Education. https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000177849 (Accessed: 2022)

UNESCO. (2015) Incheon Declaration and Framework for Action: Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all. Paris: UNESCO. Available at <u>https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000233813</u> (Accessed: 2022)

UNIA. (2018) *Diversity Barometer Education in Belgium.* Brussels: Interfederal Center for Equal Opportunities. Available at

UNIA. (2019) Vers un système d'éducation inclusif en Belgique : Inspirations et exemples. Brussels: Interfederal Center for Equal Opportunities. Available at <u>https://www.unia.be/files/Documenten/Publicaties\_docs/Vers\_un\_syst%C3%A8me\_d%E2%</u> <u>80%99%C3%A9ducation\_inclusif\_2019.pdf (</u>Accessed: 2022)

Van Hove, G., De Schauwer, E., Vaughan, M. (2017) *Inclusive Education: The way forward National Report: Belgium*. Available at <u>https://www.schooleducationgateway.eu/en/pub/resources/publications/inclusive-</u> <u>education-reports.htm (</u>Accessed: 2022)

Van Maele, D., Van Houtte, M. (2011) 'The quality of school life: teacher-student trust relationships and the organizational school context', *University of Gent*. Available at <u>https://biblio.ugent.be/publication/920790 (Accessed: 2022)</u>

Van Maele, D., Poeze, M. (2018) Transcending *educational boundaries: challenges to the educational inclusion of refugees in Europe's 2 Seas area*. Kortrijk: Vives University of Applied Sciences. Available at: <u>https://lirias.kuleuven.be/2355066?limo=0</u> (Accessed: 2022)





#### 4.2. Austria

BMBWF/1 - Federal Ministry of Education, Science and Research. The Austrian School System [<u>https://www.bmbwf.gv.at/en/Topics/school/school\_syst.html</u>] ] (Accessed: 29 July 2022)

BMBWF/2 – PädagogInnenbildung NEU (Federal Ministry of Education, Science and Research: Pedagogical education NEW)

[https://www.bmbwf.gv.at/Themen/schule/fpp/ausb/pbneu.html] (Accessed: 1 September 2022)

BMBWF (2019): Schulentwicklung mit SQA - Schulqualität Allgemeinbildung, Richtlinien ab September 2019 (Federal Ministry of Education, Science and Research: School development with SQA - School Quality General Education, guidelines as of September 2019) [https://www.bmbwf.gv.at/Themen/schule/schulrecht/rs/2019\_06.html] (Accessed: 1 September 2022)

BMBWF (2018): Grundsatzerlass "Reflexive Geschlechterpädagogik und Gleichstellung "(Federal Ministry of Education, Science and Research: Policy decree: "Reflexive gender pedagogy and equality")

[https://www.bmbwf.gv.at/Themen/schule/schulrecht/rs/2018\_21.html] (Accessed: 9 September 2022)

Bruneforth, M. et al (2012): Chancengleichheit und garantiertes Bildungsminimum in Österreich. In: Herzog-Punzenberger, B. (Hrsg.), im Auftrag des BMUKK (2012): Nationaler Bildungsbericht 2012, Teil 2, Kapitel 5 (Equal opportunities and guaranteed minimum education in Austria. In: National Education Report Austria 2012: Volume 2, commissioned by the Federal Ministry for Education, the Arts and Culture)

[https://www.bmbwf.gv.at/dam/jcr:d034218d-118c-45aa-a769-9b12fd0feb1f/nbb 2012 b02 kapitel05 23889.pdf] (Accessed: 15 September 2022)

Bruneforth, M. et al (2018): TALIS 2018 (Band 1): Rahmenbedingungen des schulischen Lehrens und Lernens aus Sicht von Lehrkräften und Schulleitungen im internationalen Vergleich. (TALIS 2018 Volume 1: Framework Conditions of School Teaching and Learning from the Perspective of Teachers and School Administrators in International Comparison) [https://www.iqs.gv.at/ Resources/Persistent/d3b0c71d9d54f150311e8267eb391678256 Ofc 2e/TALIS-2018 Gesamt final Web.pdf] (Accessed: 17 September 2022)

Bundeskanzleramt (2021): Roma in Österreich. Strategischer Rahmen der EU zur Gleichstellung, Inklusion und Teilhabe der Roma bis 2030. Strategie zur Fortführung der Inklusion der Roma in Österreich (Federal Chancellery of Austria: Roma in Austria. EU Strategic Framework for Roma Equality, Inclusion and Participation up to 2030 Strategy for the Continuation of Roma Inclusion in Austria)

[https://www.bundeskanzleramt.gv.at/dam/jcr:b556a06c-cd86-4b3da492815c8a1bfb84/Strategie%20Roma%20Inklusion.pdf] (Accessed: 9 September 2022)

Bundeskanzleramt, BMFFJI (2021): Vortrag an den Ministerrat: Fortschreibung der österreichischen "Strategie zur Fortführung der Inklusion der Roma in Österreich (Chancellery of Austria, Federal Ministry for Women, Family, Youth and Integration:





Presentation to the Council of Ministers Update of the Austrian "Strategy for the Continuation of Roma Inclusion in Austria") [https://www.bundeskanzleramt.gv.at/dam/jcr:c3070edc-e6c4-4b60a1a23b44a9f994ad/54 11 mrv.pdf] (Accessed: 11 September 2022)

Dyson (2010): Developing inclusive schools: three perspectives from England. [https://docplayer.net/21232116-Developing-inclusive-schools-three-perspectivesfromengland.html] (Accessed: 10 September 2022)

European Commission (2020): EU Roma strategic framework for equality, inclusion and participation for 2020 - 2030

[https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/info/files/eu\_roma\_strategic\_framework\_for\_equality\_in cl usion\_and\_participation\_for\_2020\_-\_2030\_0.pdf] (Accessed: 4 September 2022)

Federal Chancellery of Austria (2019): Conference on anti-Gypsyism. How to address antiGypsyism in a post-2020 EU Roma Framework? [https://www.bundeskanzleramt.gv.at/dam/jcr:e4dd0a8e-99d5-4f6db38205db80ad96c0/Conference%20on%20anti-Gypsyism%20%E2%80%93%20How%20to%20address%20antiGypsyism%20in%20a%20pos t-2020%20EU%20Roma%20Framework%20%E2%80%93%20Expert%20rec.pdf] (Accessed:

10 September 2022)

Feyerer, E. (2006): Lehrerbildung für eine integrative/inklusive Schule (Teacher education for inclusive

schools)<u>https://www.europeanagency.org/sites/default/files/Feyerer2006.doc</u>] (Accessed: 8 September 2022)

Feyerer, E. et al (2014): Einstellungen und Kompetenzen von LehramtstudentInnen und LehrerInnen für die Umsetzung inklusiver Bildung Forschungsprojekt BMUKK-20.040/0011I/7/2011 Endbericht. Attitudes and competences of student teachers and teachers for the implementation of inclusive education. Research project of the Federal Ministry for Education, Arts and CultureFinal report.) [https://www.phvorarlberg.ac.at/fileadmin/user\_upload/RED\_SOZ/PDFs/inklusive\_Bildung\_Projekt.pdf] (Accessed: 8 September 2022)

Feyerer, E. (2016): Mit Inklusiven Modellregionen auf dem Weg zur inklusiven Schule? Österreichische Bildungspolitik zwischen Vision und Pragmatismus (With Inclusive Model Regions on the Way to Inclusive Schools? Austrian education policy between vision and pragmatism) [https://www.inklusion-

online.net/index.php/inklusiononline/article/view/361/291] (Accessed: 8 September 2022)

Expertenrat für Integration (2020): Integrationsbericht 2020. (Integration Council: Integration Report 2020) [<u>https://www.bundeskanzleramt.gv.at/dam/jcr:ddb21e4d-</u> <u>a63449c5-8fd0-ba37a0ae2fbf/integrationsber\_2022\_NB.pdf</u>] (Accessed: 18 September 2022)





ExpertInnengruppe LehrerInnenbildung NEU. Im Auftrag von BMUK und BMWF (2010): LehrerInnenbildung NEU. Die Zukunft der pädagogischen Berufe. Die Empfehlungen der ExpertInnengruppe. Endbericht. (Expert Group Teacher Education NEW. Commissioned by the Federal Ministry of Federal Ministry for Education and Culture Federal Ministry of Science and Research: Teacher (Accessed: 2022)

Education NEW. The Future of the Pedagogical Professions. The recommendations of the expert group. Final report.) [https://www.qsr.or.at/dokumente/1870-20140529-092820-Empfehlungen\_der\_ExpertInnengruppe\_Endbericht\_092010\_2\_Auflage.pdf] (Accessed: 15 September 2022)

Hosi (2005): OUT in der Schule (OUT in school) [https://hosi.or.at/2006/10/10/out-inderschule/] (Accessed: 8 September 2022)

IGLYO (2022): LGBTQI+ Inclusive Education Report 2022 [https://www.educationindex.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/IGLYO-LGBTQI+-Inclusive-Education-Report-2022v3.pdf] (Accessed: 17 September 2022)

Jarren, O. et al (2017): Evaluierung des BMBF-Rahmenprogramms "Geistes-, Kultur- und Sozialwissenschaften "(Final Report of the Expert Commission. On the Evaluation of the BMBF Framework Programme "Humanities, Cultural and SocialSciences")[<u>https://www.bmbf.de/bmbf/shareddocs/downloads/files/gks\_evaluation</u> <u>sbericht\_final.pdf?\_blob=publicationFile&v=1</u>] (Accessed: 15 September 2022)

L&R Sozialforschung (2014): MigrantInnen in Wien – 2014. Einkommen, Bildung, Wohnen, Konsum und soziale Einbindung (Migrants in Vienna - 2014. Income, education, housing, consumption and social inclusion)

[https://www.arbeiterkammer.at/infopool/wien/MigrantInnenstudie\_Wien\_2015.pdf] (Accessed: 10 September 2022)

Meinhart, E., Hofer, S. (2020): Interview mit Bildungsforscherin Barbara HerzogPunzenberger "Die Halbtagsschule ist nicht vernünftig", Hrsg. Profil (Interview with educational researcher Barbara Herzog-Punzenberger "Half-day school is not reasonable", ed. Profil) [https://www.profil.at/oesterreich/bildungsforscherin-die-halbtagsschuleistnicht-vernuenftig/401125362] (Accessed: 1 September 2022)

Oberwimmer, K. et al (Hrsg.), im Auftrag des BMBWF (2018): Nationaler Bildungsbericht Österreich 2018. Band 1 (National Education Report Austria 2018. Volume 1, commissioned by the Federal Ministry of Education, Science and Research) [https://www.iqs.gv.at/ Resources/Persistent/db972c5b2eb2dc267191b05ae55adb5a05b 8 b067/NBB\_2018\_Band1\_v4\_final.pdf] (Accessed: 9 August 2022)

Streese B. et al. (2017): Inclusion: profiles for school and classroom development in Germany, Austria and Switzerland. Münster: Waxmann Zentrum polis – Politik Lernen in der Schule (2008): Interkultureller Dialog - Interkulturelles Lernen. (Intercultural Dialogue - Intercultural Learning





[https://iz.or.at/wpcontent/uploads/2020/09/Interkultureller\_Dialog\_Interkulturelles\_Ler nen.pdf] (Accessed: 22 August 2022)

UNESCO (2009) Policy Guidelines on Inclusion in Education. https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000177849] (Accessed: 30 May 2023)

#### 4.3. Ireland

Agyei, H., (2016). Breaking barriers for the inclusion of persons with disability in national development. *American Journal of Educational Research*, 4(1), pp.8-10. (Accessed: 2022)

AHEAD.[ <u>https://www.ahead.ie/journal/Using-UDL-to-redesign-education-in-response-to-diversity-]</u> (Accessed: 29 May 2023)

Ainscow, M. (2005). Developing Inclusive Education Systems: What Are the Levers for Change? Journal of Educational Change, 6, 109-124. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10833-005-1298-4 (Accessed: 2022)

Ainscow, M. & Sandill, A. (2010). Developing inclusive education systems: the role of organisational cultures and leadership, International Journal of InclusiveEducation, 14:4, 401-416, DOI: <u>10.1080/13603110802504903</u>

Association of Secondary Teachers in Ireland. https://www.asti.ie/home/ <u>Https://www.asti.ie/education-and-curriculum/inclusive-education</u>

Banks, J. A. (2021). A winning Formula? Funding Inclusive Education in Ireland. International Perspectives on Inclusive Education, Volume 15, 7-19. Emerald Publishing Limited. (Accessed: 2022)

Boyle, A., Flynn, M. & Hanafin, J. (2018). From absorption to inclusion: the evolution of Irish state policy on Travellers in L. Burton, É. Ní Shé & P. (Accessed: 2022)

Danaher (Eds.) Social Capital and Enterprise in the Modern State (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan). (Accessed: 2022)

Boyle, A., Flynn, M. & Hanafin, J. (2018). Inclusion and Leadership in Diverse and Challenging Contexts: Irish Travellers and Early Years Education. (Accessed: 2022)

Burke, J. Kenny, M. and Grummell, B. (2022) Youthreach Employee Wellbeing Report. A review of challenges, their impact and potential solutions

Burns, G., Colum, M., and O'Neill, J. (2023). 'No one sees a Traveller at the top of the class'. In: E. Keane, M. Heinz, and R. McDaid (Eds)., *Diversifying the teaching profession: Dimensions, dilemmas, and directions for the future* (pp.155-165). London: Routledge. <u>https://www.routledge.com/Diversifying-the-Teaching-Profession-Dimensions-Dilemmas-</u> and-Directions/Keane-Heinz-Daid/p/book/9781032037349] (Accessed: 29 May 2023)

Cedefop (2022). Teachers and Trainers in a changing world: Ireland. Building up competencies for inclusive, green and digitalised vocational education and training (VET) <a href="https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/country-reports/teachers-and-trainers-changing-world-ireland">https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/country-reports/teachers-and-trainers-changing-world-ireland</a>] (Accessed: 29 May 2023)





Coolahan, J. (2003). Attracting, Developing and Retaining Effective Teachers.[ <u>OECD (2003)</u> <u>Country Background Report for Ireland</u>] (Accessed: 29 May 2023)

Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex: A black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory and antiracist politics. *University of Chicago Legal Forum* Article 8. (Accessed: 2022)

Davis, K. (2008) Intersectionality as buzzword: A sociology of science perspective on what makes a feminist theory successful. *Feminist Theory*. 9(1): 67-85. (Accessed: 2022)

DEIS (2005). Delivering equality of opportunity in schools: An action plan for educational inclusion. Department of Education and Skills. www.education.ie (Accessed: 2022)

Department of Students and Youth Affairs. (2018). *LGBTQI+ National Youth Strategy (2018-2020) LGBTQI+ young people: visible, valued and included*.[<u>LGBTQI+ Youth Strategy</u>] Government of Ireland. (Accessed: 29 May 2023)

Department of Education and Science. (2017). *Delivering Equality of Opportunity in Schools*. Government of Ireland. (Accessed: 2022)

Department of Justice and Equality (2017). *Migrant Integration Strategy. A Blueprint for the Future (2017-2020)* <u>Migrant Integration Strategy</u> Government of Ireland. (Accessed: 2022)

Department of Justice and Equality (2017b). *National Strategy for Women and Girls 2017-2020: creating a better society for all.* Government of Ireland. (Accessed: 2022)

Downes, P., Nairz-Wirth, E. & Rusinaitė, V. (2017). *Structural Indicators for Inclusive Systems in and around Schools*, NESET II report, Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union, 2017. Doi: 10.2766/200506. (Accessed: 2022)

European Union (2020). Commission's Communication on Achieving the European Education Area by 2025. (Accessed: 2022)

Fleming, B., Harford, J., & Hyland, A. (2022) Reflecting on 100 years of educational policy in Ireland: was equality ever a priority? *Irish Educational Studies*, 41:3, 441-455, DOI: [10.1080/03323315.2022.2085765] (Accessed: 29 May 2023)

Eredics, N. (2018). Inclusion in Action: Practical Strategies to Modify your Curriculum. EC (European Commission). 2017. *Preparing Teachers for Diversity: The Role of Initial Teacher Education: Final Report to DG Education, Youth, Sport and Culture of the European Commission*. Brussels: EC. (Accessed: 2022)

Fovet. F. (2020). Universal Design for learning as a Tool for Inclusion in the Higher Education Classroom: Tips for the Next Decade of Implementation. *Education Journal*. Special Issue: *Effective Teaching Practice for Addressing Diverse Students Needs for Academic Success in Universities*. Vol 9, No 6, pp 163-172. (Accessed: 2022)

Grima-Farrell, C., Bain, A., & McDonagh, S. (2011). Bridging the Research-to-Practice Gap: A Review of the Literature Focusing on Inclusive Education. *Australasian Journal of Special Education*, *35*(2), [117-136.[ <u>https://doi.org/10.1375/ajse.35.2.117</u>] (Accessed: 30 May 2023)





Harmon, H. (2015). Irish Traveller and Roma Students: A Response to Ireland's Consolidated Third and Fourth Report to the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child. Dublin: Pavee Point Traveller and Roma Centre. (Accessed: 2022)

Hick, P., Matziari, A., Mintz, J., Ó Murchú, F., Hall, K, Curtin, C. & Solomon, Y. Cahill (2019). Initial Teacher Education for Inclusion. Final Research Report No 27. National Council for Special Education (NCSE) (Accessed: 2022)

Heinz, M. and E. Keane (2018) Socio-demographic composition of primary initial teacher education entrants in Ireland, *Irish Educational Studies*, 37:4, 523-543, DOI: [10.1080/03323315.2018.1521731] (accessed: 30 May 2023)

Hill Collins, P. (1998). It's All in the Family: Intersections of Gender, Race, and Nation. *Hypatia* 13(3): 62-82. (Accessed: 2022)

Inclusion BC. (2020) Annual Report (2019-2020) [https://inclusionbc.org/ourresources/annual-report-2019-2020/] (Accessed: July 2023)

Inspectorate of DES (Department of Education and Science). 2005a. *Beginning to Teach*. Dublin: Stationery Office. (Accessed: 2022)

Keane, E. and M. Heinz (2015) Diversity in initial teacher education in Ireland: the sociodemographic backgrounds of postgraduate post-primary entrants in 2013 and 2014, *Irish Educational Studies*, 34:3, 281-301 (Accessed 30 May 2023)

Kitching, K. (2010a). An excavation of the racialised politics of viability underpinning education policy in Ireland. *Irish Educational Studies, 29*(3), 213-229. (Accessed: 2022)

Kruse, S., & Dedering, K. (2018). The idea of inclusion: Conceptual and empirical diversities in Germany. Improving Schools, 21(1), 19–31. [https://doi.org/10.1177/1365480217707835] (Accessed: 30 May 2023)

Lamoureux, K., & Katz, J. (2020). Intersectionality, Indigeneity, and Inclusive Education: Reimagining Business as Usual. Exceptionality Education International, 30, 12-18. (Accessed: 2022)

Liasidou, A. (2012). Inclusive education and critical pedagogy at the intersection of disability, race, gender and class. Journal for Critical Education Policy Studies 10.1 (2012), 168-184. (Accessed: 2022)

Lodge, A. & Lynch, K. (Eds.) (2004). Diversity in Education. Dublin: The Equality Authority. (Accessed: 2022)

Maynooth University (2020). Equality, Diversity, Inclusion, and inter-culturalism. EDI Annual Report 2019/20. (Accessed: 2022)

Mac Ruairc, G., Ottesen, E & Precey. R. (2020). Collaborating for Inclusion: The Intersecting Roles of Teachers, Teacher Education, and School Leaders in Translating Research into Practice. (Accessed: 2022)

McGhie-Richmond, D. & F. Haider, (2020). Collaborating for Inclusion: The intersecting roles of Teachers, Teacher Education and School Leaders in Translating Research into Practice. Intersectionalities in Leadership Conference. Exceptionality Education International, 2020, Vol. 30, No. 2 (Accessed: 2022)





Neegan, E. (2005). Excuse me: who are the first peoples of Canada? a historical analysis of Aboriginal education in Canada then and now. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, *9*, 15 - 3. (Accessed: 2022)

Ní Bhroin, Ó (2017) Inclusion in Context: Policy, Practice and Pedagogy. Peter Lang (Accessed: 2022)

Novak, K. (2016). UDL Now! A Teacher's Guide to Applying **U**niversal **D**esign for **L**earning in Today's Classrooms. MA: CAST Publishing. (Accessed: 2022)

OECD (2021) Brussino, O. Education Working Papers. Building Capacity for Inclusive Teaching: Policies and practice to prepare all teachers for diversity and inclusion. (Accessed: 2022)

OECD's Talis (2018). insights and interpretation survey (Accessed: 2022)

OECD (2021). "Ireland", in Education at a Glance 2021: OECD Indicators, OECD Publishing, Paris. DOI: [https://doi.org/10.1787/7d62f281-en] (Accessed: 29 May 2023)

OECD (2021), Teachers and Leaders in Vocational Education and Training, OECD Reviews of Vocational Education and Training, OECD Publishing, Paris, https://doi.org/10.1787/59d4fbb1-en. (Accessed: 2022)

O'Gorman, E. & Drudy, S. (2011). Professional Development for Teachers Working in Special Education/Inclusion in Mainstream Schools: The Views of Teachers and Other Stakeholders. Dublin: NCSE.[ <u>http://ncse.ie/wp-</u>

content/uploads/2014/10/Professional\_Development\_of\_Teachers.pdf] (Accessed: 29 May 2023)

Ó Raifeartaigh, T. (1983). [Review of *Irish Education: Its History and Structure*, by J. Coolahan]. *Irish Historical Studies*, *23*(92), 380–381. <u>http://www.jstor.org/stable/30008395</u> (Accessed: 2022)

O'Rourke, J. (2015). Inclusive schooling: if it's so good – why is it so hard to sell? International Journal of Inclusive Education, 19:5, 530-546, DOI: [10.1080/13603116.2014.954641] (Accessed: 29 May 2023)

O'Sullivan, K. & Burns, G. (2018). 'Turn to Teaching: Diversifying Initial Teacher Education' In: Brian Mooney (eds). *Ireland's Yearbook of Education 2018, 2019*. Dublin: Education Matters.[<u>https://issuu.com/educationmattersie/docs/irelands\_yearbook\_of\_education\_201</u> <u>8\_1748ce984c6402/33]</u> (Accessed: 29 May 2023)

Reay, D. (2005) 'Shaun's story: troubling discourses of white working-class masculinities' in C. Skelton and B. Francis *A feminist critique of education: 15 years of gender development* Taylor & Francis: London (Accessed: 2022)

Ryan, R. (2019). How inequality in Ireland is Produced, Reproduced, Justified and Resisted at the intersection of Disability and Class. PhD Thesis. National University of Ireland, Maynooth. (Accessed: 2022)

Ryan, J. (2006) 'Inclusive leadership and social justice for schools. 'Leadership and Policy in Schools, 5 (1), pp. 3–17 (Accessed: 2022)





Ryan, J. (2006) 'Inclusive leadership and social justice for schools.' Leadership and Policy in Schools, 5 (1), pp. 3–17. (Accessed: 2022)

Ryder A (2017). *Sites of Resistance: Gypsies, Roma and Travellers in the Community, School and Academy*, London: Trentham Books at UCL IOE Press (Accessed: 2022)

Santoro, N. (2015) The drive to diversify the teaching profession: narrow assumptions, hidden complexities, *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 18:6, 858-876 [https://go.exlibris.link/D46tv1cd] (Accessed 30 May 2023)

Sider, S. (2021) Inclusive school leadership: Examining the experiences of Canadian school principals in supporting students with special education needs. Journal of Research in Special Educational Needs 21(5). DOI[:10.1111/1471-3802.12515] (Accessed 29 May 2023)

Smyth, E., Banks, J., O'Sullivan, J. McCoy, S., Redmond, P. and McGuinness, S. (2019) Evaluation of the National Youthreach Programme. Research Series Number 82. Dublin: ESRI. (Accessed: 2022)

SOLAS (2020). Future FET: Transforming Learning. The National Further Education and Training (FET) Strategy 2020-2025. Government of Ireland. (Accessed: 2022)

SOLAS (2020a) Intergenerational learning – family literacy (Accessed: 2022) SOLAS (2020b) [<u>A Conceptual Framework of Universal Design for Learning for the Irish</u> <u>Further Education and Training Sector (solas.ie)</u>] (Accessed: 29 May 2023)

SOLAS (2021c) UDL for FET Practitioners - Guidance for Implementing Universal Design for Learning in Irish Further Education and Training (solas.ie) (Accessed: 2022)

Suleymanov, F. (2015). Issues of inclusive education: some aspects to be considered. Electronic Journal for Inclusion in Education, 3(4), pp.1-23.(Accessed: 30 May 2023)

Walsh, T. (2020). 'Promoted widely but not valued': Teachers' perceptions of team teaching as a form of professional development in post-primary schools in Ireland, Professional Development in Education, DOI: 10.1080/19415257.2020.1725596 (Accessed: 2022)

Weir, S., Kavanagh, L., Kelleher, C. & Moran, E (2017) Addressing educational disadvantage. A review of evidence from the international literature and of strategy in Ireland: An update since 2005. Dublin: Educational Research Centre (Accessed: 2022)

Woodcock, S. and Woolfson, L.M., (2019). Are leaders leading the way with inclusion? Teachers' perceptions of systemic support and barriers towards inclusion. *International Journal of Educational Research*, *93*, pp.232-242 (Accessed: 2022)

Woolley, R. (2018). Understanding Inclusion: Core Concepts, Policy and Practice. UK: Routledge. (Accessed: 2022)

Zigmond, N., Kloo, A., & Volonino, V. (2009) What, Where and How? Special Education in the Climate of Full Inclusion. Exceptionality. 17. 189-204. 10. 1080/09362830903231986. (Accessed: 2022)

#### 4.4. Turkey

Ada, Ş. ve Küçükali, R. (2016). Türk eğitim sistemi ve okul yönetimi. Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık. Adıgüzel (Accessed: 2022)





O. C., Çardak Ç. (2009). An evaluation of curriculum of the computer technology and programming in vocational higher education system in Turkey: A case study. Journal of Industrial Teacher Education, 45 (3), 61-84. AB. (2000). A memorandum on lifelong learning. http://arhiv.acs.si/dokumenti/Memorandum\_on\_Lifelong\_Learning .pdf (Erişim Tarihi: 08.03.2019). (Accessed: 2022)

Akbaşlı, S. ve Durnalı, M. (2018). The perception of administrators, teachers, and master trainers working for public education centers regarding key competencies of lifelong learning. (Accessed: 2022)

In Ş.Ş. Erçetin (Ed.) . Chaos, Complexity and Leadership 2016. Springer Proceedings in Complexity, pp 493-509. Switzerland: Springer International Publishing. DOI https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-64554-4\_35 Akdeniz, K.G. & Anastasopoulos, N. (2016). Chaotic awareness and simulacra in the recent emergence of the selforganized multitude. (Accessed: 2022)

In: Ş.Ş. Erçetin (Ed.). Chaos, Complexity and Leadership 2014, Springer Proceedings in Complexity, pp 23-28. Switzerland: Springer International Publishing. DOI https://doi.org/10.1007/978- 3-319-18693-1\_3 (Accessed: 2022)

Aksoy, M. (2008). Hayat boyu öğrenme ve kariyer rehberliği ilkelerinin istihdam edilebilirliğe etkileri: Otel işletmeleri üzerine bir uygulama. (Yayımlanmamış doktora tezi), Gazi Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü: Ankara. (Accessed: 2022)

Alıcıgüzel, İ. (1979). İlk ve orta dereceli okullarda öğretim. İstanbul: İnkılap ve Aka Kitabevleri.

Alkan, C., Doğan, H., Sezgin, İ. (1994). Mesleki ve teknik eğitimin esasları. Gazi Ünv. Ankara: Gazi Üniversitesi İletişim Fakültesi Basımevi. Alpar, D., Batdal, G., Avcı, Y. (Accessed: 2022)

(2007). Öğrenci merkezli eğitimde eğitim teknolojileri uygulamaları. Hasan Ali Yücel Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 7, 19-31. (Accessed: 2022)

Aral, N. ve Gürsoy, F. (2009). Özel eğitim gerektiren çocuklar ve özel eğitime giriş. İstanbul: Morpa Kültür Yayınları. (Accessed: 2022)

Atılgan, H. (2018). Turkey'de kademeler arası geçiş: dünü-bugünü ve bir model önerisi. Ege Eğitim Dergisi / Ege Journal of Education, 19 (1), 1-18. (Accessed: 2022)

Barış, E.T. (2019). Development plans in Turkey in the context of lifelong learning (1963–2018). In: Ş. Ş. Erçetin, & N. Potas (Eds.), Chaos, complexity and leadership 2017, Springer

Proceedings in Complexity, pp 323-328. Switzerland: Springer International Publishing. DOI <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-89875-9\_27</u> (Accessed: 2022)

Başaran, İ. E. (2008). Türk eğitim sistemi ve okul yönetimi. Ankara: Ekinoks Yayınları. (Accessed: 2022)

Borazan, G. (2010). İlköğretim okulu müdürlerinin okullarına finansal kaynak bulmada karşılaştıkları güçlükler ve bu güçlüklerin okula etkilerinin değerlendirilmesi. (Yüksek lisans proje çalışması) Trakya: Trakya Üniversitesi-Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü. (Accessed: 2022)

Erçetin, Ş.Ş. and Bisaso, S.M. (2017). Migration and Refugee Crisis: Structural and Managerial Implications for Education. In Ş.Ş. Erçetin (ed). Educational Development and Infrastructure for Immigrants and Refugees, Ch 3, pp. 47-71, Hershey, PA: IGI Global Publication DOI: 10.4018/978-1-5225-3325-2.ch003. (Accessed: 2022)





Lindsay, G. (2007). Educational Psychology And The Effectiveness Of Inclusive Education / Mainstreaming. British Journal Of Educational Psychology, 77(1), 1-24. (Accessed: 2022)

https://help.unhcr.org/turkiye/faqs/education-faqs/ (Accessed: 2022)

https://www.academia.edu/22480593/Multicultural\_Education\_Curriculum\_Develop ment\_in\_Turkey (Accessed: 2022)

https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/sites/71ee93b4- en/index.html? Roma: https://minorityrights.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/Roma-in-Turkey-for-OSCE-26-Sep-2.pdf (Accessed: 2022)

#### 4.5. Greece

Ainscow, M., 2005. *Developing inclusive education systems: What are the levels for change?,* s.l.: Journal of Educational Change. (Accessed: 2022)

Anon., 2021. *National Strategy for LGBTQI+ Equality*, s.l.: s.n. https://primeminister.gr/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/ethniki\_statigiki\_gia\_thn\_isothta\_ton\_loatki.pdf(Accessed: 2022)

Asimakopoulou, E., 2018. Integration of Roma students in school: Examination of teachers' and students' stereotypes, Patra: Open Hellenic University.

https://www.apothesis.eap.gr/bitstream/repo/39807/1/%ce%91%ce%a3%ce%97%ce%9c%c e%91%ce%9a%ce%9f%ce%a0%ce%9f%ce%a5%ce%9b%ce%9f%ce%a5%20%ce%95..pdf Avraamidou, L. & Angelides, P., 2010. *Teaching informal learning environments as a means for developing more inclusive education, Education, Knowledge and Economy,* s.l.: s.n. (Accessed: 2022)

Center for Intersectional Justice., 2022. What is intersectionality, s.l.: s.n. (Accessed: 2022)

Chamtzoudis, N., 2015. Legal protection of sexual orientation and gender identity: fighting discrimination, hate crime and hate speech, s.l.: Colour Youth-Athens LGBTQ Youth Community. https://colouryouth.gr/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/Nomikos-Odigos-Pes-to-S-Emas.pdf(Accessed: 2022)

Cosmaidi, F., n.d. *Social and Educational Discrimination of Roma students,* s.l.: s.n. (Accessed: 2022)

Council of Europe, 2018. *Council recommendation on promoting common values, inclusive education and the European dimension of teaching.* s.l., s.n. https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:32018H0607(01)&from=EN(Accessed: 2022)

European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education, 2020. *Country information for Greece - Legislation and policy*, s.l.: s.n. (Accessed: 2022) European Commission against Racism and Intolerance, 2009. s.l.: s.n. https://rm.coe.int/fourth-report-on-greece/16808b5793 (Accessed: 2022)

European Journal of Special Education Research, n.d. *The role of schools and teachers' action strategies during the period of economic and social crisi: qualitative research in the prefecture of Attica, s.l.: s.n.* (Accessed: 2022)

F. Becky, &. C., 2008. *Redefining gender: contemporary approached to education,* s.l.: KETHI. https://www.kethi.gr/sites/default/files/attached\_file/file/2020-09/143\_INVESTIGATING\_GENDER\_TRANSLATION.pdf (Accessed: 2022)

Farkas, L., n.d. *Report on discrimination of Roma students in education*, s.l.: s.n. https://www.tandis.odihr.pl/bitstream/20.500.12389/21933/1/08101.pdf(Accessed: 2022)





IGLYO, 2022. *LGBTQI+ Inclusive Education Report.* s.l., s.n. https://www.educationindex.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/IGLYO-LGBTQI+-Inclusive-Education-Report-2022.pdf(Accessed: 2022)

Iliopoulou, C., Nickolakakis, N., Diakoumakou, F. & Grammenidis, K., 2018. *The experiences off LGBTQI+ student community in Secondary Education, First Panhellenic Study on the School Climate,* Athens: Colour Youth- LGBTQI+ Youth Community in Athens. https://rb.gy/zd5atc (Accessed: 2022)

Kaimara, P., Fokidis, E., Oikonomou, A., & Alevriadou, A. (2021). "A questionnaire on Greek future teachers' feelings, attitudes and concerns about co-teaching". (Accessed: 2022)

Lenakakis, A., Howard, J. L. & Felekidou, K., 2018. *Play and Inclusive Education: Greek Teachers' attitudes*, s.l.: s.n.

http://ikee.lib.auth.gr/record/299608/files/Krystalia%20Felekidou%20et%20al.pdf (Accessed: 2022)

Michalokiakou, T., 2021. *Education as a key to migrant students integration in the European Union-The educators' role in Greece,* s.l.: s.n.

https://dione.lib.unipi.gr/xmlui/bitstream/handle/unipi/13510/Michaloliakou\_19014.pdf.pd f?sequence=1&isAllowed=y (Accessed: 2022)

Ministry of Education, 2021. *The pilot testing of the sex education program in school settings and its horizontal initiation from the new academic year, s.l.: s.n.* (Accessed: 2022)

Ministry of Education, n.d. Refugees and Education, s.l.: s.n. (Accessed: 2022)

Mitakidou, S., n.d. *Crucial Issues in Roma students education*, s.l.: Aristoteles University of Thessaloniki. http://peroma.web.auth.gr/peroma/sites/roma/files/files/2292015\_17.pdf (Accessed: 2022)

Pateraki, M., Orphanidou, F. & Skibas, A., 2018. *Survey on teachers' experience of the implementation of the thematic axis "gender identities" in the school year 2016-17*, Athens: Raibow School. https://rainbowschool.gr/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Ereuna-Emfules-tautotites-Rainbow-School-2016-2017.pdf (Accessed: 2022)

Patithra, T., 2020. *Roma students in education,* Korinthos: s.n. https://amitos.library.uop.gr/xmlui/bitstream/handle/123456789/5812/%CE%A0%CE%91% CE%A4%CE%97%CE%98%CE%A1%CE%91%20-

%20%CE%94%CE%99%CE%A0%CE%9B%CE%A9%CE%9C%CE%91%CE%A4%CE%99%CE%9A% CE%97%20%CE%95%CE%A1%CE%93%CE%91%CE%A3%CE%99%CE%91.pdf?sequence=1&isA llowed=y (Accessed: 2022)

Petrakou, I. & Xanthakou, G., n.d. *Migration and Education in Greece*, s.l.: E.M.ME.DIA.

http://emmedia.pspa.uoa.gr/fileadmin/emmedia.pspa.uoa.gr/uploads/Resources/P ublications/Dimosieuseis\_Sinergaton/migration\_education.pdf (Accessed: 2022)

Roma Civil Society Monitor, 2018. Exhibition of Civil Society Bodies for the implementation of the National Strategies about the Roma people's integration in Greece, s.l.: s.n.

https://cps.ceu.edu/sites/cps.ceu.edu/files/attachment/basicpage/3034/rcm-civil-society-monitoring-report-2-greece-2018-eprint-gr.pdf(Accessed: 2022)





Schuelka, J. M., 2018. *Implementing Inclusive education*, s.l.: University of Birmingham.

https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/media/5c6eb77340f0b647b214c599/374\_I mplementing\_Inclusive\_Education.pdf(Accessed: 2022)

Stamatis, G., 2022. Roma students in Greece and multidimensional poverty – The National Strategy and Action Plan for Roma Social Inclusion 2021-2030, s.l.: s.n. https://www.unicef.org/eca/sites/unicef.org.eca/files/2022-02/Greece%20-%20Roma%20students%2C%20multidimensional%20poverty%20and%20the%20Greek%20n ational%20strategy%20for%20Roma%20Inclusion.pdf (Accessed: 2022)

Strati, P., 2017. *The inclusion of students with typical and non-typical development in the general education class and their transition from kinderagarten to primary school,* Ioannina: University of Ioannina. https://freader.ekt.gr/eadd/index.php?doc=44155&lang=el#p=16,

Sytziouki, M., 2022. Teachers and trainers in a changing world – Greece: Building up competences for inclusive, green and digitalised vocational education and training (VET). Cedefop ReferNet thematic perspectives series.

https://cumulus.cedefop.europa.eu/files/vetelib/2022/teachers\_and\_trainers\_in\_a\_changin g\_world\_Greece\_Cedefop\_ReferNet.pdf(Accessed: 2022)

UNESCO, 2016. *Call for Action by Ministers: Inclusive and equitable Education for All learners in an environment free from discrimination and violence,* s.l.: s.n. UNICEF, 2017. Inclusive education. (Accessed: 2022)

Vergidis, D. (2014) *The Education of Roma in Greece*. University of Ioannina, Department of Education.https://www.researchgate.net/publication/331080410\_THE\_EDUCATION\_OF\_RO MA\_IN\_GREECE (Accessed: 2022)

Vousvouni, E., 2019. Teachers' perspectives on issues of sexual expressions of sexuality in the school environment. Dissertation within the framework of the MSc "School Psychology" of the Department of Psychology of the National and Kapodistrian University of Athens, s.l.: s.n. https://pergamos.lib.uoa.gr/uoa/dl/frontend/file/lib/default/data/2874991/theFile (Accessed: 2022)

Zisi, V. & Katsarou, D., 2015. Problems and perspectives of co-teaching as a method of developing inclusive education. Proceedings of the 2nd Scientific Conference of the Panhellenic Association of School Counselors Educational Policies for the School of the 21st Century, Thessaloniki: s.n. (Accessed: 2022)

